# IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT <br> EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN <br> SOUTHERN DIVISION 

| ----------------------------------------------------------- x |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| In re | $\vdots$ | Chapter 9 |
| CITY OF DETROIT, MICHIGAN, | $\vdots$ | Case No. 13-53846 |
|  | $\vdots$ |  |
| Debtor | $\vdots$ | Hon. Thomas J. Tucker |

## DEBTOR'S REPLY TO RESPONSE TO OBJECTION TO CLAIM NUMBERS 3798 AND 3799 FILED BY BRIDGET MURRIEL

The Debtor, the City of Detroit (the "City"), by and through its undersigned counsel, for its reply (the "Reply") to Bridget Murriel's response (the "Response") [Dkt. No. 9700] to the City's Twelfth Omnibus Objection to Certain Late-Filed Claims ("Twelfth Omnibus Objection") [Dkt. No. 9567] regarding claim numbers 3798 and 3799 (the "Claims"), respectfully states as follows:

## BACKGROUND

1. On July 18, 2013 (the "Petition Date"), the City filed this case.
2. On November 21, 2013, this Court entered its Order, Pursuant to Sections 105, 501, and 503 of the Bankruptcy Code and Bankruptcy Rules 2002 and 3003(c), Establishing Bar Dates for Filing Proofs of Claim and Approving Form and Manner of Notice Thereof (the "Bar Date Order") [Dkt. No. 1782].
3. On July 9, 2014, this Court entered its Order Pursuant to 11 U.S.C. § 105(a) and Fed. R. Bankr. P. 3007 Approving Claim Objection Procedures [Dkt. No. 5872] (the "Claims

Procedures Order"), allowing the City to file an omnibus objection with respect to claims which were late-filed. (Claim Procedures Order at 2.).
4. The Bar Date Order established February 21, 2014 (the "Bar Date") as the deadline for filing certain claims against the City.
5. On or about November 29, 2013, Ms. Murriel was served notice of the Bar Date Order. See Certificate of Service filed by the City's Noticing Agent Kurtzman Carson Consultants, LLC ("KCC") on December 27, 2013, [Dkt. No. 2337].
6. The Bar Date Notice stated that the proof of claim had to be received on or before the Bar Date. See Bar Date Order, Annex 1, pp. 1, 8.
7. The Bar Date Notice also stated that if a proof of claim was not filed by the Bar Date, the claimant would not be entitled to receive distributions from the City. See Bar Date Order, Annex 1, p. 9.
8. On December 3, 2014, Ms. Murriel filed the Claims as general unsecured claims in an unliquidated amount.
9. On March 30, 2015, the City filed its Twelfth Omnibus Objection [Dkt. No. 9567]. The claims that the City objected to in the Twelfth Omnibus Objection were filed after the Bar Date.
10. The City objected to Ms. Murriel's Claims in the Twelfth Omnibus Objection because Ms. Murriel's claims were filed over nine months after the Bar Date, on December 3, 2014. A copy of Ms. Murriel's Proof of Claim No. 3798 is attached as Exhibit 1, and Proof of Claim No. 3799 is attached as Exhibit 2.
11. On or about March 30, 2015, the City served Ms. Murriel with notice of the Twelfth Omnibus Objection. See Notice at Dkt. 9567.
12. On April 16, 2015, Ms. Murriel filed her Response to the Twelfth Omnibus Objection with the Court [Dkt. 9700]. The Response does not further explain the basis for the Claims, nor does it provide any reason for why the Claims were late-filed.

## ARGUMENT

13. Bar dates are designed to promote finality and efficient administration of the bankruptcy process. In re National Steel Corp., 316 B.R. 510, 514 (Bankr. N.D. Ill. 2004). Typically, claimants who do not timely file proofs of claim are barred from receiving distributions from the estate. Id. at 515. In National Steel, an entity affiliated with the debtors sought to file a claim seeking indemnification after the bar date. The court declined to allow the late-filed claim because of the negative impact it would have on the estate and other creditors. Id. at 521. See also In re Settlement Facility Dow Corning Trust, 2009 U.S. Dist LEXIS 110133 (E.D. Mich. Nov. 25, 2009) (Hood, J.) (denying late-filed claim in the Dow Corning breast implant case where movant failed to timely file claim, and the allowance of such late-filed claim, in combination with the other late-filed claims would prejudice the administration of the case, and the claimants who had timely filed their claims).
14. Here, the Claims, which seek unliquidated amounts, should be disallowed and expunged because they were not timely filed, because allowance of such claims will prejudice the thousands of other claimants who did timely their claims, and because the delay in filing was solely in the control of Ms. Murriel.
15. The Bar Date Notice clearly indicated that claims had to be received at KCC's facility on or before the Bar Date.
16. Ms. Murriel does not dispute that fact or allege any deficiency in the Bar Date Order, its accompanying notice, or the service of such notice on her.
17. Ms. Murriel does not present facts to support any argument for why her late-filed claims should be permitted.
18. Ms. Murriel counsel received notice of the Bar Date, which clearly indicated that the proof of claim was to be received at KCC's facility on or before February 21, 2014 at 4:00 p.m. E.S.T. Ms. Murriel's Claims were not received by KCC on or before the Bar Date. See Ex. 1, 2. In fact, Ms. Murriel's Claims were not received by KCC until December 3, 2014.
19. As such, Ms. Murriel's Claims should be expunged as late-filed.
20. To the extent the Court does not disallow the Claim as late-filed, the City reserves its rights to object to the Claim on any other grounds.

WHEREFORE, the City respectfully requests that this Court enter an order disallowing and expunging the Claim, and granting the City such other and further relief as this Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: May 1, 2015
FOLEY \& LARDNER LLP

By:/s/ John A. Simon
John A. Simon (P61866)
Jeffrey S. Kopp (P59485)
Tamar N. Dolcourt (P73425)
Leah R. Imbrogno (P79384)
500 Woodward Ave., Ste. 2700
Detroit, MI 48226
313.234.7100
jsimon@foley.com
jkopp@foley.com
tdolcourt@foley.com
limbrogno@foley.com
Counsel for the Debtor, City of Detroit, Michigan

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 1, 2015, I caused the City of Detroit's Reply to Response to Objection to Claim Numbers 1798 and 1799 Filed By Bridget Murriel to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF system, which sent notification of such filing to all ECF participants in this bankruptcy case. I hereby certify that a copy was also served via Federal Express to the following party:

Bridget Murriel<br>3324 Hogarth St.<br>Detroit, MI 48206

Dated: May 1, 2015
FOLEY \& LARDNER LLP

By:/s/ John A. Simon
John A. Simon (P61866)
Jeffrey S. Kopp (P59485)
Tamar N. Dolcourt (P73425)
Leah R. Imbrogno (P79384)
500 Woodward Ave., Ste. 2700
Detroit, MI 48226
313.234.7100
jsimon@foley.com
jkopp@foley.com
tdolcourt@foley.com
limbrogno@foley.com
Counsel for the Debtor, City of Detroit, Michigan

## EXHIBIT 1

B10 (Official Form 10) (04/13) (Modified)


Penalty for presenting fraudulent claim: Fine of up to $\$ 500,000$ or imprisonme

****************************************************************)


## my eduation background is agualivant

 to a Masters and Higher
## Zoriclet infurseef 12.02.14




To Whom This May Concern,
Thank you for your time! I needed the information to show the bankruptcy Judge that I tried to resolve the reason why I was reverted back to a Personnel and Payroll Clerk for no reason. I have the exact information I need. You've explained in detail of how investigations are conducted within the Police Human Resources Department. Sorry, if I offended you doing my investigation of why I received this unfair treatment. I will let the bankruptcy court decide my out come. My intentions were not to harass the Police Human Resources Department, sorry but I needed answers.

Thank you!
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Muriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Mike Duggan, Mayor
Question to the Court:

If a supervisor lied about an employees work performance, is this considered breaching the contract? My career has been ruined because former Deputy Chief Angela obeyYoung lied about my work performances on my evaluation form. Pleasereview e-mails based upon my investigation to resolve,



Test Results for title Personnel $t$ Payroll Clerk


## Re: Breach of Contract -- Fraud Explaination of Work Performance

| From: | Gail Oxendine |
| :---: | :---: |
| To: | Murriel, Bridget; Perkins, Crystal; Tennille, Brian; ENRIGHT, DELA |
| CC: | Mailbox, BJones_MB; Tolliver, Tina; HOUSER, LASHINDA; CRAIG, JAMES |
| Date: | Tuesday - December 2, 2014 11:52 AM |
| Subject: | Re: Breach of Contract -- Fraud Explaination of Work Performance |
| Attachments: | TEXT.htm; Bridget Murriel - Investigation Findings and Decision 11.25.2014.pdf; Bridget Murriel - Investigation Documents.pdf; Fwd: Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Endosed; Memo Attached is in violation of the Due Process of Laws; Breach of Contract -- Fraud Explaination of Work Performance; Proof of Former Deputy Chief Angela O'bey-Young trying to undermine me; My Introduction To Commander Lee E-Mail Attached; E-mail Forwarded To Commander Lee ; Fwd: new forms for separations team |

## Ms. Murriel,

Per your request, attached are the documents reviewed and considered during my investigation. Your work performance of processing lump sums was not considered, as this was not the subject of the investigation. The investigation was to determine if the Human Resources Rule 7 - Probations, and the AFSCME collective bargaining unit where followed with respect to the probationary period for your promotion to Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk on March 10, 2008.

On Wednesday, November 26, 2014, I provided you with my investigation findings and decision (see attached). The communication also informed you that the decision was final and the case was considered closed. Subsequent to my communication on Wednesday, November 26, 2014, you have sent seven (7) emails (see attached). Each time, you have made basically the same assertions as you have made during the past $61 / 2$ years. No additional information or documentation was provided which supports your position. You also have asserted that the City of Detroit is in breach of contract and that my investigation findings (memo) was unconstitutional. However, no breach of contract has occurred, nor is the memo unconstitutional.

Ms. Murriel, please note that on November 26, 2014, I indicated that you are to refrain from contacting Police HR staff regarding this matter (me included), as the final detemination has been made and the case is closed. Your continuing to make contact, as evidenced by the seven (7) emails you sent subsequent to November 26, 2014, and the numerous times (since 2008) you have requested the same issue be investigated by both the Central HR Department and Police HR, could be considered harassment, which is creating a hostile work environment. Civilian employees who commit this violation are subject to disciplinary action, up to and including discharge from employment. I strongly urge you to cease your communications to the Police HR Office regarding this matter.

You are welcome to pursue this matter with any other agency or entity as you choose. However, once again, this matter is closed and will no longer be considered by the Police HR Office.

Gail A. Oxendine
Human Resources Director - Police
City of Detroit - Police Department
1301 Third Street
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-596-2730
Email: oxendineg@detroitmi.gov
Michael Duggan, Mayor
Police Chief James E. Craig's vision:
"The Detroit Police Department is a model of sustained policing excellence that places our neighborhoods and people first."
>>> Bridget Murriel 11/30/2014 1:10 PM >>>
To Whom This May Concern,
Please review attachment! Former Deputy Chief Angela O'bey-Young breached the contract with false accusations stating I need additional experience of Lump Sums, Leave of Absence, Suspensions, and Inactive Unit Status (1105). I know how to process everything she mentioned in her explanation. I designed, and computerized the Lump Sum Payout spreadsheets for Police Payroll Separation Team with the assistant of former contractual ITS employee Elmore Snead. I know everything about using PPS2K (B20), WORKBRAIN, Oracle applications. I am a degreed Computer Programmer, Business Administration, and Accountant with concentration in Payroll. Several co-workers were promoted to Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerks who did not pass the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk test. I was told that management used my Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk to promote a co-worker because the co-worker did not pass the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk test in the year of 2002. I was never promoted in the year 2002 as a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk. At the time, I was a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at the Police Payroll Department. My City of Detroit Work History can explain the exact dates of my employment with the City of Detroit. My City of Detroit Work History is attached to previous e-mails sent. Please review! If the truth was written on the attached evaluation form, my reversion would not be based upon my work performance. I did not know the City of Detroit support reversions of employees based upon an individual jealousy. If research was properly conducted of my work performance the outcome would be different of your decision Ms. Oxendine on your memo you provided to me via e-mail 11/26/14. I am unclear of the practices of business ethics at the City of Detroit. Did your investigation include Lump Sum Payout spreadsheets that I processed for police employees. I processed Lump Sum Payouts for General City of Detroit employees on PPS2K (B20), and WORKBRAIN from 07/14/08-11/18/11 without any problems. Ms. Oxendine please explain, how did I return back to Police Payroll, my work performance is excellent, I am currently at the same level as a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk when first employed with the City of Detroit Police Payroll Department performing Senior Personnel \& Payroll tasks processing New Hire, Re-Hire, Payroll Adjustments, and Separations tasks with my education background? Ms. Oxendine please explain the difference between processing General City Lump Sum Payouts from Police Lump Sum Payouts? General City has never inform me that I need additional experience processing Lump Sum Payouts, Leave of Absence, Suspensions, and placing employees in Inactive Status (Unit 1105). I have never had a problem processing any payroll tasks.

## Sincerely

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Mike Duggan, Mayor


DATABASE

City of Detroit Recommendation on Permanent Status Final Probation/Trial Period Report


Attendance and Tardiness Record Dates: From _To__


Explain all exceeds expectationg and unsatisfactory ratings. Be specific.


Employee Certification: I understand that my signature does not imply agreement with this evaluation. I also understand that I may submit a statement of explanation to be included, along with this evaluation, in the official record, as well as pursue any avenues of appeal available to me.

| Employee Signature FeLCoP \& | Date $06.0 \% 00$ |
| :---: | :---: |
| Human Resources |  |
| D-opcur with Departmejial Recommendation | D Other |
|  | By $\quad$ - Date |
|  | $\square$ Entered into PPS Date _ |
| Hunan Resources Approval Date 1 , | - Ented Mo PPS Date |

## Probation/Trial Period Evaluation

 Effective 12/02/02pg. 4

# DATABAS鼻 

City of Detroit
Recommendation on Permanent Status Final Probation/Trial Period Report


##  <br>  <br>  <br>  <br>  <br>  <br> Trume (12) <br>  <br> woulderokinina

JułY 11, 2000

Erxagel finura
$33 \$$ Hogarth
Darom, wif 48208
Dasa Ma, thelet


RE: PROBATMONARY HEVEASION
You pertomanca ofld rol matet the expected slandards to twe ciassincalikn of St, Fanomel a Fayrol
Ciert.


Cor

Shcerety:


Humen Rexolumes Consulant
Emptorwa Servicas Olvtsion
cre Branal Richmend - HRC
Lawana Ducher - Orector polto Pemonel
Angsla Oboy- Young - Pakee Paynil
AFSCME Local 1023
fle
$H$

Via Email and Hard Copy
December 9, 2008

Ms, Bridget Murriel
Human Resources Department
Payroll Division
507 Coleman A Young Municipal Center
Detroit, MI 48226

RE: Demoted for No Reason - Email request-Henrings \& Policy Non-Union Grievance

Ms. Murriel:
I am in receipt of your email of December 9, 2008. The Hearings \& Policy Unit of $H R$ has responsibility for grievances filed pursuant to Human Resources Department Rule 17. Upon receipt of your request for assistance, I attempted to assemble the pertinent information so I could provide an informed response.

A review of KR documents indicates:

- On or about March 10, 2008, pursuant to a Status Change effective this date, you were named a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk;
- On or about March 20, 2008, you signed a Notification of Probation advising you of a three (3) month probationary period for the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk position. Additionally, the Notification advises that a final evaluation will be made prior to either granting you permanent status, extending your probation or reverting you to your last prior status;
- On or about June 4, 2008, the Police Department recommended an extension of your probation;
- You were notified on July 9, 2008 that you would be reverted effective July 14, 2008;
- On or about July 11, 2008, you were notified of your probationary reversion.

The position in questions is subject to the collective bargaining agreement with AFSCME. The Master AFSCME Agreement provides in pertinent part:

- Section 9(b) - any grievance under this Agreement which is not filed in writing within twenty (20) working days after the gricuance arises shall not be considered a grievance.

NOTE: In your email you reference filing a grievance with you Union Representatives. You did not relay the status of your union grievance, however, assuming it was filed timely, that would be your avenue of recourse.

Human Resources Department Rules 17 provides the process and procedures for Employee Grievances. Rule 17 provides in pertinent part:

Section 3 (c) A classified employee covered by a collective bargaining contract containing a grievance procedure providing for a final and enforceable resolution of a grievance shall, unless the contract calls for a specific and exclusive procedure, elect at the outset in accordance with $3(f)$ of this section to use either the commission procedure or the contract procedure, but mat not use both.

## NOTE:

(1) In your email, you indicate you have filed a grievance with your union reps, therefore you are not able to elect at the outset to use the commission procedure. You have already initiated the union procedure and the rule is clear you may not use both.
(2) The AFSCME Master agreement provides in Section $9(f)$ that the grievance procedure contained in this Agreement shall be the exclusive grievance procedure for all members of the bargaining unit, Again the reference set forth above clearly provides that HR Rule 17 is not available if the contract provides the contractual grievance is an exclusive procedure.

Therefore, for the reasons set forth in the letter, it does not appear that 1 am your last resort. You may pursuc the union grievance as mentioned in your email. However, having initiated that process, you may not file a concurrent non-union grievance pursuant to Rule 17.

If any of the status change, probationary and reversionary information is factually incorrect, please advise and provide supporting documentation. I am not commenting on the assessment of your job performance as I have no personal knowledge other than the factors as set forth in the probationary and reversion documents. I am more than willing to revisit thy analysis if I am not correctly reciting the facts.

As always, if you have any additional questions, please feel free to contact me.
Sincerely,

cc. Kimberly Hall, General Manager Renee Lester, HR Consultant File

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENITA |
| Date: | $11 / 4 / 20105: 21$ PM |
| Subject: | Re: Fwd: newhireltr.doc - FYI |
| Ms. Cheatom, |  |

I was employed at Police Payroll from 04/27/02-07/31/05 before I was lald off. I was nominated employee of the quarter for the period of October 1, 2002 - December 31, 2002. Im processing payroll currently the same as a Senior. I designed everything about Police Payroll. Ask to see my processed work ace-Parker. Someone is lying and it is not me. I know excellent job considering I was never paid Out-of-Class for my work at Polisell and it will tell you the truth. I did an
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murrie!
Payroil \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitml.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
>>> BENTTA CHEATOM 11/4/2010 3:15 PM >>>
Ms. Muriel,
-
Per the attached, you were retumed to the Personnel \& Payroll Clerk title because you did not successfully complete the probation
period for the title Sr. Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at the Police Department.
B> Gail Oxendine $11 / 4 / 2010$ 1:46 PM $\ggg \gg$
Bridget,
Please contact Benita Cheatom regarding this matter. I'm sure the grounds for reversion related to your return to $H R$.
G3> Bridget Murriel 11/4/2010 12:33 PM >>>
I was reverted back to a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk for no reason.
Human Resource Payron
Bridget L Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
Cly of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48225
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Emat: BriMun@detroitmiogoy
Dave Bing, Mayor
>>> Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 11:54 AM >>>
Bridget,

Bridget,
What is this and why have you sent this to me?
Gail A. Oxendine, Human Resources Director
City of Detroit - Human Resources Department
316 Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
Two Woodward Avenue
Detrolt, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-1345
Fax: 313-224-1750
Email: oxendineg@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
3>8 Bridget Murriel 11/4/2010 10:20 AM >>>
Good Morning HR,
Please Review Attachment!
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget LL Murrie:
Payroll \& Personnet Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Averue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313 -224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.goy

## Dave Bing, Mayor

>>> Renee Laster 3/6/2008 10:14 AM >>>
Reporting information for Monday, 3/10/OB.
Renee Laster
Human Resources Consultant
Employee Services Division
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
Room 316
313-224-3730 Phone
313-224-5609 Fax

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENITA |
| Date: | $11 / 4 / 2010$ 5:35 PM |
| Subject: | Re: Fwd; newhireltr.doc - FYI |
|  |  |
| Ms. Cheatom, |  |

1 was setup by management. Angela Obey-Young had no intentions of passing my probation. I over heard Angela obey-Young
telling Ester Ramos that she was not going to pass my probation and she could not wait to tell me I did not pass my probation.
Human Resource Payron
Bridget L. Murriet
Payroil \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detrolt, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
\$32 Bridget Murriel 11/4/2010 5:21 PM >>>
Ms. Cheatom,
I was employed at Police Payrol from 04/27/02 07/31/05 before I was laid off. I was nominated employee of the quarter for the period of October 1, 2002 - December 31, 2002 . Im processing payroll currently the same as a Senlor. I designed and Police Payroll. Ask to senance for Police Payroll not Vicki Rice-Parker. Someone is lying and it is not me I kingned and polce Payroll. Ask to see my processed work at Police Payroll and it will tell you the truth It is not me I know everything about never paid Out-of-Qass for my work at Police Payroll. I can prove it was a fe.
Human Resource Payroll

## Bridget L. Murriel

Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detrolt - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Wcodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-528-0771
Emall: BiMuradetroitmi.goy
Dave Bing, Mayor

Ms
Ms. Muriel,
M. Mura,

Per the attached, pou were returned to the Personnel \& Payroll Clerk title because you did not successfully complete the probation period for the tifle Sr. Personnel \& Payoll Cerk at the Police Department.

```
$>> Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 1:46 PM >>>
```

Pease contact Benita Cheatom regarding this matter. I'm sure the grounds for reversion related to your retum to $H R$.

[^0]P>> Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 11:54 AM >>>
Bridget,
What is this and why have you sent this to me?
Gail A. Oxendine, Human Resources Director
Gty of Detroit - Human Resources Department
316 Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
Two Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-1345
Fax: 313-224-1750
Email: oxendineapoderritmi, ooy
Dave Bing, Mayor
$\ggg$ Bridget Murriel 1I/4/2010 10:20 AM $\ggg$
Good Moming HR,
Please Review Attachment!
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Derk
Oty of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Colernan A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi,gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
>>> Renee Laster 3/6/2008 10:14 AM >>>
Reporting information for Monday, $3 / 10 / 08$.
Renee Laster
Human Rescurces Consutant

## Employee Services Division

Coleman A.Young Municipal Ctr.
Room 316
313-224-3730 Phone
313-224-5609 Fax

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENITA |
| Date: | $11 / 5 / 2010$ 10:57 AM |
| Subject: | Disrespected |

## Ms. Cheatom,

I am being disrespected because of this lie by Supervisors and Co-workers.

Human Resource Payroll<br>Bridget L. Murriel<br>Payroll \& Personnel Clerk<br>Cty of Detroit - Payroh Department<br>Suite\#t 628<br>Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.<br>2 Woodward Avenue<br>Detroit, Michigan 48226<br>Office: 313-224-3940<br>Fax: 313-628-0771<br>Email: BriMur@detroitmigov<br>Dave Bing, Mayor

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :---: |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENTA |
| Date: | $11 / 10 / 2010$ 10:35 AM |
| Subject: | Bridget Murriel |

Good Morning Ms. Cheatom,
I am very disappointed of how one person can tell a lie on a person, and everyone believed what she said, without any Investigation. Renee Laster knew I worked at Police Payroll for three years, and 3 months before Angela O'bey-Young laid me off because of her on personal reasons. In order to be nominated for something you have to do something to help the department. Why would management of Police Payroll nominate me "Employee of the Quarter"??? I know how to process Police Payroll very well. No one else was nominated. I need answers to why no one asked me questions of why I did not sign the evaluation document. This has been a one sided scenario from the beginning of the lie. One of the GOD's commandments is "Thou shall not bare faise witness against thy nelghbor". I guess Angela O'bey-Young is unaware of this commandment and others who follow her lie she told against me. My career is damaged from this lie Angela O'bey-Young told against me.
P.S. Ms. Cheatom please help me resolve this liel

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Emall: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENTA |
| Date: | 11/12/2010 9:29 AM |
| Subject: | Re: Bridget Murriel |
| CC: | Mayor, Mayor |
| Ms. Cheatom, |  |

I filed a grievance with all three unions I was employed at the time. I brought it to eveyone's attention and nothing was done about her lying on me. I am trying to resolve this matter with current management. I have in writing from Angela 0 bey Young of what a great employee 1 am. I am being harassed by Bobbie Jo Wright. She constantly tries to write me up for no reason. I took the test twice and passed their are employees who are Seniors and did not pass the test. What can you do for me now? I am tried of Bobbie Jo Wright disrespecting me and trying to write me up for no reason. Maybe I have to pursue legal help outside the city to resolve unethical business practices.

Thank youl

Human Resource Payrol
Bridget L. Murrie
Payroll \& Personned Clerk
Cty of Detroit - Payroil Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Emall: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
>>> BENITA CHEATOM 11/10/2010 7:29 PM >>>
Good evening Ms. Muriel,
There is nothing that I can do about your having been reverted during your probation pertod for Senior $P$ \& $P$ at DPD. The Probation Evaluation form contains the following statement pertaining to your signature and resolution options that were available to you:


#### Abstract

Employee Certification: I understand that my signature does not imply agreement with this evaluation, I also understand ihal I may submit a statement of explanation to be included, along with this evaluntion, in the official record, ws well as pursue any avenues of appeal available


 10 me .Please note that the time limit for filing a grievance about this matter expired over 2 years ago.
>>> Bridget Murriel 11/10/2010 10:35 AM >>>
Good Morning Ms. Cheatom,
I am very disappointed of how one person can tell a lie on a person, and everyone bellieved what she said, without any investigation. Renee Laster knew 1 worked at Police Payroll for three years, and 3 months before Angela O'bey-Young laid me off because of her on personal reasons. In order to be nominated for something you have to do something to help the departinent. Why would management of Police Payroll nominate me "Employee of the Quarter"?7?? I know how to process Police Payroll very well. No one else was nominated. I need answers to why no one asked me questions of why I did not sign the evalutation document. This has been a one sided scenario from the beginning of the lle. One of the GOD's commandments is "Thou shail not bare false witness against thy neighbor'. I guess Angela O"bey-Young is unaware of this commandment and others who follow her lie she told against me. My career is damaged from this lie Angela Obey-Young told against me.
P.S. Ms. Cheatom please help me resolve this liel

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Muriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Sulten 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Emall: BriMuredetroitmisov
Dave Bing, Mayor

# HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT 

## RULE 7

## PROBATION PERIODS

## Section 1. Nature of Probation Period

Probationary periods construed as "working test" periods are required in selection and placement processes to supplement other evaluations to determine whether an employee fully meets the performance and entrance qualifications for the classification in which employed.

## Section 2. Employment Requiring Probation Period

Probationary periods are required:
a. In all cases of initial certified hire to the classified service.
b. In all cases of promotion in the classified service.
c. In all cases of transfer, transfer-promotion or transfer-demotion, including all cases of transfer between departments.
d. In all instances of reinstatement to the classified service.
e. In all instances of certification and employment from a preferred reemployment list to a classification different than the re-employment list.

## Section 3. Duration of Probation Period

The period of probation in any classification shall commence immediately upon date of hire or the effective date of a change in status, but may not be prior to the employee's assumption of the duties.
a. For the following classifications, the probation period shall be six months: all supervisory, administrative, professional, technical and trainee classifications.
b. For all other classifications in which employment is on a full-time basis for three months or more the probation period shall be three months.
c. Exceptions to (a) and (b) above may be established by action of the

Human Resources Director and may be requested by the head of the employing department.

## Section 4. Probation Reports

a. Probation report forms shall be provided to departments by the Human Resources Department.
b. At such times during the probation period and in such manner as the Human Resources Department may require, the department head or his designated representative shall report to the Human Resources Department evaluations of the employee's work performance and qualifications for the classification in which employed.
c. Probation reports shall be reviewed with the employee prior to the expiration of the probation period. Such reports must be received by the Human Resources Department no later than 15 days following the expiration of the probation period.
d. An employee subject to a probation period, either upon initial hire or status change, shall be deemed as having acquired regular status in the classification in which employed upon the expiration of the probation period unless the employing department, on a timely basis, submits a report of unsatisfactory performance or requests an extension of the probation period.

## Section 5. Extension of Probation Period

A probation period may, upon departmental request, be extended once for an interval not to exceed the length of the initial period provided that written reasons acceptable to and approved by the Human Resources Department are provided by the employing department.

## Section 6. Termination of Probation

a. Initial Hire:

1. At any time during an employee's initial hire probation period, a department head or his designated representative may recommend the discharge of the employee if observed performance is such that the employee appears to be unable, unwilling or unqualified to perform the duties of the classification in which employed or that the employee's habits and dependability do not merit continuance
of the employee in City service. Such recommendation must be supported by written reasons.
2. At the time of the recommendation to discharge, the department may remove the probationary employee from employment by suspension pending action on the recommendation to discharge. If the recommendation is approved by the Human Resources Director, the department may proceed to discharge the employee.
b. Promotions, Transfers, etc.
3. The employing department shall report its evaluation of the departmental recommendation as to the retention of the employee or the reversion of the employee to the employee's last prior status.

Unless the Human Resources Director finds that a department recommendation for reversion in status is not warranted, and so notifies the employing department, the employee shall revert to the employee's last prior status effective as of the date the employee is so reassigned.
2. No employee serving a probation period as a condition to a status change may be discharged except for reasons which would have been grounds for discharge in the position held previous to the status change.

## Section 7. Additional Provisions on Probation Periods

a. All employees must satisfactorily complete the probationary period required for the classification in which employed, to be considered eligible for promotion or transfer to any other classification.
b. Where an employee has been certified and is laid off prior to completion of the probation period, he shall be placed on the preferred eligible list and shall upon re-certification be required to complete the probation period.
C.S.C. Adopted: $12 / 16 / 75$

Revised: 04/22/80



DATABASE

City of Detroit Recommendation on Permanent Status Final Probation/Trial Period Report


Attendance and Tardiness Record Dates: From __ To


Explain all exceeds expectations and unsatisfactory ratings. Be specific.
 submit a statement of explanation to be included, along with this evaluation, in the official record, as well as pursue any avenues of appeal available to me.


## Approved by Authority

Clit of Detroit, copyright At wights reserved

## DATABASe

City of Detroit
Recommendation on Permanent Status Final Probation/Trial Period Report



December 9, 2008

Ms. Bridget Murriel

Human Resources Department
Payroll Division
507 Coleman A Young Municipal Center
Detroit, M1 48226
RE: Demoted for No Reason - Email request -Hearings \& Policy Non-Union
Grievance
Ms. Murriel:
I am in receipt of your email of December 9, 2008. The Hearings \& Policy Unit of $H \mathbb{R}$ has responsibility for grievances filed pursuant to Human Resources Department Rule 17. Upon receipt of your request for assistance, I attempted to assemble the pertinent information so I could provide an informed response.

A review of $H R$ documents indicates:

- On or about March 10, 2008, pursuant to a Status Change effective this date, you were named a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk;
- On or about March 20, 2008, you signed a Notification of Probation advising you of a three (3) month probationary period for the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk position. Additionally, the Notification advises that a final evaluation will be made prior to either granting you permanent status, extending your probation or reverting you to your last prior status;
- On or about June 4, 2008, the Police Department recommended an extension of your probation,
- You were notified on July 9, 2008 that you would be reverted effective July 14, 2008;
- On or about July 11, 2008, you were notified of your probationary reversion.

The position in questions is subject to the collective bargaining agreement with AFSCME The Master AFSCME Agreement provides in perinent par:

- Section 9(b) - any grievance under this Agreement which is not filed in writing within twenty (20) working days after the grievance ariscs shall not be considered a grievance.

NOTE: In your email you reference filing a grievance with you Union Representatives. You did not relay the status of your union grievance, however, assuming it was filed timely, that would be your avenue of recourse.

Human Resources Department Rules 17 provides the process and procedures for Employee Grievances. Rule 17 provides in pertinent part

Section 3 (c) A classified employee covered by a collective bargaining contract containing a grievance procedure providing for a final and enforceable resolution of a grievance shall, unless the coutract calls for a specific and exclusive arocedure, elect at the outset in accordance with $3(f)$ of this section to use either the commission procedure or the contract procedure, but muty not ase both.

## NOTE:

(1) In your email, you indicate you have filed a grievance with your union reps, therefore you are not able to elect at the outset to use the commission procedure. You have already initiated the union procedure and the rule is clear you may not use both.
(2) The AFSCME Master agreement provides in Section $9(f)$ that the grievance procedurc contained in this Agreernent shall be the exclusive grievance procedure for all members of the bargaining unit. Again the reference set forth above clearly provides that HR Rule 17 is not available if the contract provides the contractual grievance is an exclusive procedure.

Therefore, for the reasons set forth in the letter, it does not appear that I am your last resort. You may pursue the union grievance as mentioned in your email. However, having initiated that process, you may not file a concurrent non-union grievance pursuant to Rule 17.

If any of the status change, probationary and reversionary information is factually incorrect, please advise and provide supporting documentation. I arn not commenting on the assessment of your job performance as I have no personal knowledge other than the factors as set forth in the probationary and reversion documents. I am more than willing to revisit my analysis if I am not correctly reciting the facts.

As always, if you have any additional questions, please feel free to contact me.
Sincerely,

cc. Kimberly Hall, General Manager Rence Laster, HR Consultant
File

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENITA |
| Date: | $11 / 4 / 2010$ 5:21 PM |
| Subject: | Re: Fwd: newhireltr.doc - FYI |
|  |  |

I was employed at Police Payroll from 04/27/02-07/31/05 before I was laid off. I was nominated employee of the quarter for the period of October 1, 2002 - December 31, 2002. Im processing payroll currently the same as a Senior. I designed everything about Police Payroll Ask to see Payroll not Vickl Rice-Parker. Someone is hing and it is not me. I know excellent job consldering I was never paid Out-of-Glass for my work atice Payroll and it will tell you the truth. I did an Human Resource Payroll

Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48225
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
$\ggg$ BENITA CHEATOM $11 / 4 / 20103: 15 \mathrm{PM} \ggg$
Ms, Muriel.

Per the attached, you were returned to the Personnel \& Payroll Clerk title because you did not successfully complete the probation period for the title Sr. Personnel \& Payrol Clerk at the Police Department.
l> $>$ Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 1:46 PM $\ggg \ggg$
Bridget,

Flease contact Benita Cheatom regarding this matter. I'm sure the grounds for reversion related to your return to HR
c>> Bridget Murtiel 11/4/2010 12:33 PM $\ggg \gg$
I was reverted back to a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk for no reason.
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L Murrieł
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Datroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMuradetroitml gov
Dave Bing, Mayor

## >>> Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 11:54 AM >>> Bridget,

What is this and why have you sent this to me?
Gail A. Oxendine, Human Resources Director
City of Detroit - Human Resources Department 316 Coleman A. Young Munlcipal Ctr.
Two Woodward Avenue
Detrolk, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-1345
Fax: 313-224-1750
Email oxendineg@detroimionov
Dave Bing, Mayor

2>3 Bridget Murriel 11/4/2010 10:20 AM >>> Good Morning HR,

## Please Review Attachment!

## Human Resource Payroll

Bridger L. Murriet
Payroll \& Personnel Clark
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 62B
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@desoitmi.goy
Dave Bing, Mayor

## >>> Renee Laster 3/6/2008 10:14 AM >>> <br> Reporting information for Monday, 3/10/08.

## Renee Laster

Human Resources Consultant
Employee Services Division
Colemarn A. Young Municipal Cor.
Room 316
313-224-3730 Phone
313-224-5609 Fax

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENTTA |
| Date: | $11 / 4 / 2010$ 5:35 PM |
| Subject: | Re: Fwd: newhireltr.doc-FYI |
| Ms. Cheatom, |  |

# 1 was setup by managenent. Angela Ober-Young had no intentions of passing my probation. I over heard Angela Obey-Young telling Ester Ramos that she was not going to pass my probation and she cout not wath to tell , <br> Human Resource Payroll 

Qridget L. Murriet
Payran \& Personnel Clerk
Cty of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-394D
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor

3>> Eridget Murriel 11/4/2010 5:21 PM >>>
Ms. Cheatom,

I was employed at Pofice Payrol from 04/27/02 $007 / 31 / 05$ before 1 was laid off. I was nominated employee of the quarter for the period of October 1, 2002 * December 31, 2002. Im processing payroll currently the tame computerized file Maintenance for Police Payroll not Vicki Rice-parker, sumy the same as a Senlor. I designed and Police Payroll. Ask to see my processed work at Police Payroll and it will tell youn is lying and it is not me. I know everything about never paid Out-of-Class for my work at Police Payroll. I can prove it was alle. you the truth. I did an excellent job considering I was
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipat Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detrotmi.goy
Dave Bing, Mayor

Ms. Muriel
MITA CHEATOM 11/4/2010 3:15 PM >>>
Ms. Muriel,
Per the attached, you were returned to the Personnel \& Payroll clerk title because you did not successfully complete the probation period for the tite Sr. Personnel \& Payroll Derk at the Police Department.
$\ggg$ Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 1:46 PM $\ggg$
Bridget,
Please contact Benita Cheatom regarding this matter. I'm sure the grounds for reversion related to your return to HR

| I was reverted back to a Personnel |
| :---: |
| Human Resource Payroll |
| Bridget L. Murriel |
| Payroll \& Personnel Clerk |
| City of Detrait * Payroll Department |
| Sulte\# 628 - |
| Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr. |
| 2 Woodward Averue |
| Detroit, Michigen 48226 |
| Office: 313-224-3940 |
| Fax: 313-628-0771 |
| Email: BriMuradetrpitmigoy |
| Dave Bing, Mayor |

>>> Gail Oxendine 11/4/2010 11:54 AM >>>
Bridget,
What is this and why have you sent this to me?
Gail A. Oxendine, Human Resources Director
Gity of Detroit - Human Resources Department
316 Coleman A. Young Munlipal Crr.
Two Woodward Avenue
Detrot, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224:1345
Fax: 313-224.1750
Email: oxendinen@detroitmi,oov
Dave Bing, Mayor
$3 \gg$ Enidget Murriel 11/4/2010 10:20 AM >>>
Good Morning HR
Pease Review Attachment!
Human Respurce Payroll
Eridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
Cty of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suiter 628
Colernan A. Young Municipal Cr2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Emall: BriMurodetroitmigoy
Dave Bing, Mayor
>>> Renee Laster 3/6/2008 10:14 AM >>>
Reporting information for Monday, $3 / 10 / 08$.
Renee Laster
Human Resources Consutant

## Employee Services Division Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr. <br> Room 316 <br> 313-224-3730 Phone <br> 313-224-5609 Fax

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BNITA |
| Date: | $11 / 5 / 2010$ 10:57 AM |
| Subject: | Disrespected |

Ms. Cheatom,
I am being disrespected because of this lie by Supervisors and co-workers.

## Human Resource Payroll

Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - PayroH Department
Suite\#t 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Offle: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov

## Dave Bing, Mayor

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENTA |
| Date: | $11 / 10 / 2010$ 10:35 AM |
| Subject: | Bridget Murriel |

Good Morning Ms. Cheatom,
I am very disappointed of how one person can tell a lie on a person, and everyone believed what she said, without any Investigation. Renee Laster knew I worked at Police Payroll for three years, and 3 months before Angela O'bey-Young laid me off because of her on personal reasons. In order to be nominated for something you have to do something to help the department. Why would management of Police Payroll nominate me "Employee of the Quarter"???? I know how to process Police Payroll very well. No one else was nominated. I need answers to why no one asked me questions of why I did not sign the evaluation document. This has been a one sided scenario from the beginning of the lie. One of the GOD's commandments is "Thou shall not bare faise witness against thy neighbor". I guess Angela O'bey-Young is unaware of this commandment and others who follow her lie she told against me. My career is damaged from this lie Angela O'bey-Young told against me.
P.S. Ms. Cheatom please help me resolve this liel

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor

| From: | Bridget Murriel |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | CHEATOM, BENTTA |
| Date: | $11 / 12 / 20109: 29 \mathrm{AM}$ |
| Subject: | Re: Bridget Murriel |
| CC: |  |
| Ms. Cheatom, | Mayor, Mayor |

I filed a grievance with all three unions I was employed at the time. I brought it to eveyone's attention and nothing was done about her lying on me. I am trying to resolve this matter with current management. I have in writing from Angela 0 bey Young of what a great employee I am. I am being harassed by Bobble Jo Wright. She constantly tries to write me up for no reason. I took the test twice and passed their are employees who are Seniors and did not pass the test. What can you do for me now? 1 am tried of Bobble Jo Wright disrespecting me and trying to write me up for no reason. Maybe I have to pursue legal help outside the city to resolve unethical business practices.

Thank you!

Human Resource Payrol
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
Oity of Detroit - Payroil Department
Suite\# 628
Coleman A. Young Muricipa Ctr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor
$\ggg$ BENITA CHEATOM 11/10/2010 7:29 PM >>>
Good evering Ms. Muriel,
There is nothing that 1 can do about your having been reverted during your probation period for Senior $P$ \& $P$ at $D P D$. The Probation Evaluation form contains the following statement pertaining to your signature and resolution options that were available to you:


#### Abstract

Employee Certificution: I understand that my signature does not imply agreement with this evaluation I also understand that I may submit a staternent of explantion to be included, along with this evaluation, in the official record, as well as pursue any avenucs of appeal available to me.


Please note that the time limit for filing a grievance about this matter expired over 2 years ago.

```
>> Bridget Mumiel 11/10/2010 10:35 AM >>>
Good Morning Ms, Cheatom,
```

I am very disappointed of how one person can tell a lie on a person, and everyone believed what she sadd, without any Investigation. Renee Laster knew I worked at Pollce Payroll for three years, and 3 months before Angela O'bey-Young lald me off because of her on personal reasons. In order to be nominated for something you have to do something to help the department. Why would management of Police Payroll nominate me "Employee of the Quarter"?7?? 1 know how to process Police Payroll very well. No one else was nominated. I need answers to why no one asked me questions of why I did not sign the evaluation document. This has been a one sided scenario from the beginning of the lie. One of the GOD's commandments is "Thou shail not bare false witness agalnst thy nelghbor". I guess Angela O'bey-Young is unaware of this commandment and others who follow her lie she told against me. My career is damaged from this lie Angela O'bey-Young told against me.

## P.S. Ms. Cheatom please heip me resolve this llel

## Human Rescurce Payrod

## Bridget L. Murriel

Payroll \& Persomel Clerk
Cty of Detroit - Payroll Department
Sulten 628
Coleman A. Young Municipal Cr.
2 Woodward Avenue
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-224-3940
Fax: 313-628-0771
Email: BriMuredetroitmi.gov
Dave Bing, Mayor

# HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT 

RULE 7

## PROBATION PERIODS

## Section 1. Nature of Probation Period

Probationary periods construed as "working test" periods are required in selection and placement processes to supplement other evaluations to determine whether an employee fully meets the performance and entrance qualifications for the classification in which employed.

## Section 2. Employment Requiring Probation Period

Probationary periods are required:
a. In all cases of initial certified hire to the classified service.
b. In all cases of promotion in the classified service.
c. In all cases of transfer, transfer-promotion or transfer-demotion, including all cases of transfer between departments.
d. In all instances of reinstatement to the classified service.
e. In all instances of certification and employment from a preferred reemployment list to a classification different than the re-employment list.

## Section 3. Duration of Probation Period

The period of probation in any classification shall commence immediately upon date of hire or the effective date of a change in status, but may not be prior to the employee's assumption of the duties.
a. For the following classifications, the probation period shall be six months: all supervisory, administrative, professional, technical and trainee classifications.
b. For all other classifications in which employment is on a full-time basis for three months or more the probation period shall be three months.
c. Exceptions to (a) and (b) above may be established by action of the

Human Resources Director and may be requested by the head of the employing department.

## Section 4. Probation Reports

a. Probation report forms shall be provided to departments by the Human Resources Department.
b. At such times during the probation period and in such manner as the Human Resources Department may require, the department head or his designated representative shall report to the Human Resources Department evaluations of the employee's work performance and qualifications for the classification in which employed.
c. Probation reports shall be reviewed with the employee prior to the expiration of the probation period. Such reports must be received by the Human Resources Department no later than 15 days following the expiration of the probation period.
d. An employee subject to a probation period, either upon initial hire or status change, shall be deemed as having acquired regular status in the classification in which employed upon the expiration of the probation period unless the employing department, on a timely basis, submits a report of unsatisfactory performance or requests an extension of the probation period.

## Section 5. Extension of Probation Period

A probation period may, upon departmental request, be extended once for an interval not to exceed the length of the initial period provided that written reasons acceptable to and approved by the Human Resources Department are provided by the employing department.

## Section 6. Termination of Probation

a. Initial Hire:

1. At any time during an employee's initial hire probation period, a department head or his designated representative may recommend the discharge of the employee if observed performance is such that the employee appears to be unable, unwilling or unqualified to perform the duties of the classification in which employed or that the employee's habits and dependability do not merit continuance
of the employee in City service. Such recommendation must be supported by written reasons.
2. At the time of the recommendation to discharge, the department may remove the probationary employee from employment by suspension pending action on the recommendation to discharge. If the recommendation is approved by the Human Resources Director, the department may proceed to discharge the employee.
b. Promotions, Transfers, etc.
3. The employing department shall report its evaluation of the departmental recommendation as to the retention of the employee or the reversion of the employee to the employee's last prior status.

Unless the Human Resources Director finds that a department recommendation for reversion in status is not warranted, and so notifies the employing department, the employee shall revert to the employee's last prior status effective as of the date the employee is so reassigned.
2. No employee serving a probation period as a condition to a status change may be discharged except for reasons which would have been grounds for discharge in the position held previous to the status change.

## Section 7. Additional Provisions on Probation Periods

a. All employees must satisfactorily complete the probationary period required for the classification in which employed, to be considered eligible for promotion or transfer to any other classification.
b. Where an employee has been certified and is laid off prior to completion of the probation period, he shall be placed on the preferred eligible list and shall upon re-certification be required to complete the probation period.
C.S.C. Adopted: $12 / 16 / 75$

Revised: 04/22/80

To: Bridget Murriel, Personnel and Payroll Records System Clerk
From: $\quad$ Gail A. Oxendine, Director of Police Personnel
Subject: Reversion from Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk to Personnel and Payroll Clerk - July 14, 2008

You have made several inquiries since 2008 with respect to your reversion as referenced above. You have indicated that you were reverted in error, and that you passed your probationary period as a Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk. Upon review of your personnel files, and the documents you have submitted, below is a summary of the facts, my findings and decision.

## Summary of Events

- You were transferred-promoted to Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk at the Police Department on March 10, 2008.
- On March 20, 2008, you were issued a Notification of Probation by your supervisor, Odessa Lewis. Your initial probation trial period was March 10, 2008 - June 10, 2008. The Notification of Probation (which you signed), indicates the following: "I understand that my status in this position is that of a probationary employee and that in order to qualify for permanent status, I must demonstrate an acceptable level of work performance during the probation period." Also, the notification states, ". . . Based on the final evaluation, the decision will be made to grant you permanent status, extend the probation period, revert you to your last prior status, or terminate employment."
- On June 4, 2008, your probation was extended for 90 to enable you to gain additional experience with the payment of lump sums, processing suspensions and leaves of absence, and processing inactive employees. The extended probationary period was June 10, 2008 - September 10, 2008. It is noted on the form that you refused to sign the Probation Trial Period Report. Your refusal to sign, however, did not negate your probation being recommended for extension by your immediate supervisor, approved by the division manager and approved by the Central Human Resources Director.
- On July 11, 2008, you were notified that you were being reverted to your previous status as a Personnel and Payroll Clerk effective July 14, 2008. This transaction was again recommended by your immediate supervisor, approved by the division manager, and approved by the Central Human Resources Director. It is noted that you refused to sign the Final Probation Report. However, again, your refusal did not negate the approval of the reversion. It should also be noted, that on the Final Probation Report, there is an Employee Certification statement which reads, "I understand that my signature does not imply agreement with this evaluation. I also
understand that I may submit a statement of explanation to be included along with this evaluation, in the official record, as well as pursue any avenues of appeal available to me." Your file does not contain any record of your filing a grievance with AFSCME, or any written statement with respect to your disagreement with the decision of reversion.
- On December 9, 2008, you sent an email to the Hearings and Policy Division of the Human Resources Department with respect to the reversion. Ms. Brenda Braceful, Hearings and Policy Manager provided a three page response to your inquiry. Her response indicated that you said you filed a grievance with your union regarding this matter and she advised that you continue this path, as you were not eligible to file a grievance as set forth in Human Resources Department Rule 17 - Employee Grievances. In 2008, the AFSCME labor agreement provided that the grievance procedure contained within the labor agreement "shall be the exclusive grievance procedure for all members of the bargaining unit."
- On November 4, 2010, you contacted me, Gail A. Oxendine, who was then, the Human Resources (HR) Director for the City of Detroit. I referred you to the HR Manager for the HR Department, Ms. Benita Cheatom.
- On November 4, 2010 you contacted Ms. Benita Cheatom, HR Manager, regarding this same matter. Several emails were exchanged between you and Ms. Cheatom regarding this matter. Ms. Cheatom indicated there was nothing that could be done about this issue since you had been reverted to the Human Resources Department from Police two years prior. She indicated that the time limit for filing a grievance had expired two years prior. She also brought to your attention the Employee Certification statement on the final trial report as referenced earlier. You indicated you had filed grievances with three unions and that your prior Police supervisors lied about your performance.
- November, 2014, you again have made inquiries to Crystal Perkins, Business Analyst, Police HR, and to me, Gail A. Oxendine, Director of Police Personnel. However, you have not provided any additional information than what was provided in 2008 and 2010.


## Findings

- You were duly informed of your initial probationary period of 90 days. Your probationary period was recommended and approved for extension for an additional 90 days, in accordance with HR Rule 7 - Probation Periods and the AFSCME Labor Agreement.
- Prior to the end of the probation extension, you were recommended and approved for reversion to your prior classification and department. You were duly informed of the reversion.
- Although you indicated you filed grievances with three unions, you have NOT provided the final disposition of the grievance(s), nor is there any record in your personnel files with respect to a grievance being filed.
- There is no written record submitted by you, in June or July 2008, of your disagreement with the decision to extend your probation, or to revert to your previous classification. The first written notification of your disagreement was in December 2008, which was beyond the time period in which the AFSCME labor agreement provided for filing grievances.
- You have requested this matter be examined on at least three different occasions during the past $61 / 2$ years. You have been informed on each occasion, the rationale for reversion, and that there is nothing further the City of Detroit can do regarding this matter.

Given the above, your reversion from Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk to Personnel and Payroll Clerk effective July 14, 2008, was proper, in accordance with Human Resources Rules, and is upheld. Please note that no further consideration will be given in this matter. This matter is considered permanently closed. Any further communication regarding this matter will not be addressed.


GAIL A. OXENDINE
Director of Police Personnel

## EXHIBIT 2

B10 (Official Form 10) (04/13) (Modified)







 However．youl emplownent may ba tarmizated for


 mopied in the ish sperificiten for yer posion．
ZMPLOYEE CETTHEADON







TOTHE SUPERVISON



 deaty as passion
Supervison cerciflcation


 $\qquad$ sue $3=2005$

Ce Errpioyer Sentces Spocting Erymye

Nosica of ${ }^{7}$ abation

毒美


男

# Breach of Contract -- Fraud Explaination of Work Performance 

From: Bridget Murriel<br>To:<br>Gail Oxendine [OxendineG@detroitmi.gov](mailto:OxendineG@detroitmi.gov); Brian Tennille <Brian Tennille>; Crystal Perkins<br>[PerkinsC@detroitmi.gov](mailto:PerkinsC@detroitmi.gov); DELIA ENRIGHT <DELIA ENRIGHT><br>BJones_MB@detroitmi.gov [BJones_MB@detroitmi.gov](mailto:BJones_MB@detroitmi.gov)<br>C.<br>Sunday - November 30, 2014 1:10 PM<br>Date:<br>Subject:<br>Attachments:<br>Breach of Contract -- Fraud Explaination of Work Performance<br>Text.htm; Fwd: Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed; City Of Detroit Recommendation on Permanent Status Form. pdf


#### Abstract

To Whom This May Concern,

Please review attachment! Former Deputy Chief Angela O'bey-Young breached the contract with false accusations stating I need additional experience of Lump Sums, Leave of Absence, Suspensions, and Inactive Unit Status (1105). I know how to process everything she mentioned in her explanation. I designed, and computerized the Lump Sum Payout spreadsheets for Police Payroll Separation Team with the assistant of former contractual ITS employee Elmore Snead. I know everything about using PPS2K (B20), WORKBRAIN, Oracle applications. I am a degree Computer Programmer, Business Administration, and Accountant with concentration in Payroll. Several co-workers were promoted to Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerks who did not pass the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk test. I was told that management used my Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk to promote a co-worker because the co-worker did not pass the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk test in the year of 2002. I was never promoted in the year 2002 as a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk. At the time, I was a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at the Police Payroll Department. My City of Detroit Work History can explain the exact dates of my employment with the City of Detroit. My City of Detroit Work History is attached to previous e-mails sent. Please review! If the truth was written on the attached evaluation form, my reversion would not be based upon my work performance. I did not know the City of Detroit support reversions of employees based upon an individual jealousy. If research was properly conducted of my work performance the outcome would be different of your decision Ms. Oxendine on your memo you provided to me via e-mail 11/26/14. I am unclear of the practices of business ethics at the City of Detroit. Did your investigation include Lump Sum Payout spreadsheets that I processed for police employees. I processed Lump Sum Payouts for General City of Detroit employees on PPS2K (B20), and WORKBRAIN from 07/14/08-11/18/11 without any problems. Ms. Oxendine please explain, how did I return back to Police Payroll, my work performance is excellent, I am currently at the same level as a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk when first employed with the City of Detroit Police Payroll Department performing Senior Personnel \& Payroll tasks processing New Hire, Re-Hire, Payroll Adjustments, and Separations tasks with my education background? Ms. Oxendine please explain the difference between processing General City Lump Sum Payouts from Police Lump Sum Payouts? General City has never inform me that I need additional experience processing Lump Sum Payouts, Leave of Absence, Suspensions, and placing employees in Inactive Status (Unit 1105). I have never had a problem processing any payroll tasks.


Sincerely
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:
Mike Duggan, Mayor

Corunna Yeoman ktwispal Cement
3 Woopwrat Anim. SUTH310

Prover (3! 3) 23-1;
Fax (33) 204344

## Via Email and Hard Copy

December 9, 2008

Ms. Bridget Murriel
Human Resources Department
Payroll Division
507 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
Detroit, MI 48226

## RE: Demoted for No Reason - Email request -Hearings \& Policy Non-Union Grievance

Ms. Muriel:
I am in receipt of your email of December 9, 2008. The Hearings \& Policy Unit of HR has responsibility for grievances filed pursuant to Human Resources Department Rule 17. Upon receipt of your request for assistance, I attempted to assemble the pertinent information so I could provide an informed response.

A review of HR documents indicates.

- On or about March 10, 2008, pursuant to a Status Change effective this date, you were named a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk;
o On or about March 20, 2008, you signed a Notification of Probation advising you of a three (3) month probationary period for the Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk position. Additionally, the Notification advises that a final evaluation will be made prior to either granting you permanent status, extending your probation or reverting you to your last prior status;
- On or about June 4, 2008, the Police Department recommended an extension of your probation;
- You were notified on July 9, 2008 that you would be reverted effective July 14, 2008;
- On or about July 11. 2008, you were notified of your probationary reversion.

The position in questions is subject to the collective bargaining agreement with AFSCME. The Master AFSCME Agreement provides in pertinent part:

* Section 9(b) - any grievance under this Agreement which is not fled in writing within twenty (20) working days after the grievance arises shall not be considered a grievance.

NOTE In your email you reference fling a grievance with you Union Representatives. You did not relay the status of your union grievance; however, assuming it was filed timely, that would be your avenue of recourse.

Human Resources Department Rules 17 provides the process and procedures for Employee Grievances. Rule 17 provides in pertinent part:

Section 3 (e) A classified employee covered by a collective bargaining contract containing a grievance procedure providing for a final and enforceable resclution of a grievance shall, unless the contract calls for a specific and exclusive procedure, elect at the outset in accordance with 3 (f) of this section to use either the commission procedure or the contract procedure, but may not use both.

NOTE:
(1) In your email, you indicate you have filed a grievance with your union reps, therefore you are not able to elect at the outset to use the commission procedure. You have already initiated the union procedure and the rule is clear you may not use both.
(2) The AFSCME Master agreement provides in Section $9(f)$ that the grievance procedure contained in this Agreement shall be the exclusive grievance procedure for all members of the bargaining unit. Again the reference set forth above clearly provides that HR Rule 17 is not available if the contract provides the contractual grievance is an exclusive procedure.

Therefore, for the reasons set forth in the letter, it does not appear that I am your last resort. You may pursue the union grievance as mentioned in your email. However, having initiated that process, you may not file a concurrent non-union grievance pursuant to Rule 17.

If any of the status change, probationary and reversionary information is factually incorrect please advise and provide supporting documentation. I am not commenting on the assessment of your job performance as I have no personal knowledge other than the factors as set forth in the probationary and reversion documents. I am more than willing to revisit my analysis if I am not correctly reciting the facts.

As always, if you have any additional questions, please feel free to contact me.
Sincerely,

cc: Kimberly Hall, General Manager Renee Laster, HR Consultant File


絃 11 ,

6rixy





RE: PROBANONARY REVEASIOM



Center on Monday. Aly 14,2008 at $\mathrm{e}: 50$ AM
 Bund Plctmond at $313-224$-3725

Sheryalf:


RENEE LASTER
Humbn Resourcea Consulant
Enctoyat Servicas Olvision
cen Grand fictwond - HAC
Lawana Duckis - Deccior Potce Fersome
Angata Obey-Young - Polce Payoll
AFSCME LOCEI 1023
FT

H


## Attachments

3/20/2008 Notification of Probation
6/4/2008 Probation Report
7/11/2008 Probationary Revision
Human Resources rule 17: Employee Grievances
AFSCME Master Agreement - Section 9 Stipulation to the Grievance Procedure


AGY SPEC SEO
ACTION
QQ2 HIRE-REGULAR CLASSIFIED
OOS LAYOFFALCK OF WRK/LCK OF FNOS
062
063
064
065


12002
12005
12007
12008
2908
2908
2009
2612
2014
$4 / 29 /$
$3 / 29 /$
$1 / 221$
$3 / 16 /$
$3 / 101$
$7 / 141$
$2 / 131$
$7 / 161$
$5 / 161$
 011 RERIRE-RETURN FROH LAYOFF
Q12 CHANGE IN BARGAINING UNIT
 RATE INFORKATION







CETA GROSS苗

 PER


GROS5
©
5
3
2
3
3
3
3
 No.


026

 USEO

 WEEK AVERAGE B1163. 17
©
26


Memo Attached is in violation of the Due Process of Laws

From:<br>To:<br>CC: Bridget Murriel<br>Gail Oxendine [OxendineG@detroitmi.gov](mailto:OxendineG@detroitmi.gov); Crystal Perkins [PerkinsC@detroitmi.gov](mailto:PerkinsC@detroitmi.gov); Brian Tennille <Brian Tennille>; DELIA ENRIGHT <DELIA ENRIGHT><br>BJones_MB@detroitmi.gov [BJones_MB@detroitmi.gov](mailto:BJones_MB@detroitmi.gov)<br>BC:<br>Date:<br>Subject:<br>Attachments:<br>Saturday - November 29, 2014 8:31 AM<br>Memo Attached is in violation of the Due Process of Laws<br>Text.htm; Fwd: Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed


#### Abstract

To Whom This May Concern, Ms. Oxendine the attached memo you submitted to me via e-mail is supporting a breach of contract in my Notice of Probation contract signed by Odessa Lewis and I (Bridget Murriel) on March 20, 2008. My Notice of Probation document was included within the investigation in the findings of the Hearing and Policy Department. A breach of contract has occurred when I did not receive anything in writing about a probation extension after my final probation date 06/10/08 according to my Notice of Probation contract. Ms. Oxendine your memo is in violation of the Due Process of Laws clause. Michigan law defines a contract as a legally binding agreement between two or more competent parties. A breach of contract occurs when a party breaks a contractual promise; a party damaged by a breach of contract may sue in civil court. Michigan law requires a breaching party to pay for losses resulting from a broken contract. A breaching party may also be required to fulfill the bargain exactly as it was made. The extended extension does not exist. I was never informed of a probation extension after 06/10/08. According to my Notice of Probation contract I passed my probation 06/10/08, Ms. Oxendine your memo is illegal, invalid, and unconstitutional according to the Due Process of Laws clause. I am an expert in Computer Science, Business Administration, and Accounting (concentration in payroll). My Notice of Probation contract was breached with false accusations, and has no supporting document in writing to prove false accusations of an extended probation after 06/10/08. The Hearing and Policy investigation did not find any extended probation document after 06/10/08. Ms.Oxendine please provide a copy of the extended probation after 06/10/08 to Chief James Craig, President of City Council Brenda Jones, Civilian Police Union President Delia Enright, and I (Bridget Murriel). Ms. Gail Oxendine you are supporting false claims to a breached contract.


Sincerely
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:
Mike Duggan, Mayor

## Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed

| From: | Gail Oxendine |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Murriel, Bridget; Perkins, Crystal |
| CC: | Tennill, Brian; ENRIGHT, DELIA |
| Date: | Wednesday - November 26, 2014 12:12 PM |
| Subject: | Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed |
| Attachments: | TEXT.htm; Bridget Murriel - Investigation Findings and Decision 11.25.2014.pdf |

Ms. Murriel,

Please see the attached investigation findings and my decision, with respect to the issue referenced below. l've been made aware that you have continuously approached HR Bureau staff regarding this issue, both before and after your email to me requesting a review of this concern. The attached decision is final, and therefore, it is expected that effective immediately, you will refrain from communicating with HR Staff on this matter.

Thank you.

Gail A. Oxendine
Human Resources Director - Police
City of Detroit - Police Department
1301 Third Street
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-596-2730
Email: oxendineg@detroitmi.gov
Michael Duggan, Mayor

Police Chief James E. Craig's vision:
"The Detroit Police Department is a model of sustained policing excellence that places our neighborhoods and people first."
\ggg Bridget Murriel 11/24/2014 1:37 PM \ggg
To Whom This May Concern,

Please review attachments submitted by the Hearing \& Policy investigation! I passed my probation period 06/10/08 as stated on my City of Detroit Notification of Probation form. The City of Detroit Notification of Probation form states Length of Probation 3 months, Final Probation Due 06/10/08, and the document is signed by my former Supervisor Odessa Lewis and I (Bridget Murriel) on 03/20/08. I was reverted to Personnel \& Payroll Clerk on 07/14/08. My last day worked as a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk was 07/11/08. I worked 4 months, and 4 days under the title Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at Police Payroll until 07/14/08 when I was reverted back for no sound reason.

Thank you!

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
13-53846-tjt Doc 9781-3 Filed 05/01/15 Entered 05/01/15 14:44:10 Page 14 of 23
http://gw.detroitmi.gov/gw/webacc?User.context=f165a171d965c19ff0622574cc... $\quad 11 / 29 / 2014$

City of Detroit - Payroll Department Detroit Public Safety Headquarters 1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:

Mike Duggan, Mayor

To: Bridget Murriel, Personnel and Payroll Records System Clerk
From: $\quad$ Gail A. Oxendine, Director of Police Personnel
Subject: Reversion from Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk to Personnel and Payroll Clerk - July 14, 2008

You have made several inquiries since 2008 with respect to your reversion as referenced above. You have indicated that you were reverted in error, and that you passed your probationary period as a Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk. Upon review of your personnel files, and the documents you have submitted, below is a summary of the facts, my findings and decision.

## Summary of Events

- You were transferred-promoted to Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk at the Police Department on March 10, 2008.
- On March 20, 2008, you were issued a Notification of Probation by your supervisor, Odessa Lewis. Your initial probation trial period was March 10, 2008 - June 10, 2008. The Notification of Probation (which you signed), indicates the following: "I understand that my status in this position is that of a probationary employee and that in order to qualify for permanent status, I must demonstrate an acceptable level of work performance during the probation period." Also, the notification states, ". . . Based on the final evaluation, the decision will be made to grant you permanent status, extend the probation period, revert you to your last prior status, or terminate employment."
- On June 4, 2008, your probation was extended for 90 to enable you to gain additional experience with the payment of lump sums, processing suspensions and leaves of absence, and processing inactive employees. The extended probationary period was June 10, 2008 - September 10, 2008. It is noted on the form that you refused to sign the Probation Trial Period Report. Your refusal to sign, however, did not negate your probation being recommended for extension by your immediate supervisor, approved by the division manager and approved by the Central Human Resources Director.
- On July 11, 2008, you were notified that you were being reverted to your previous status as a Personnel and Payroll Clerk effective July 14, 2008. This transaction was again recommended by your immediate supervisor, approved by the division manager, and approved by the Central Human Resources Director. It is noted that you refused to sign the Final Probation Report. However, again, your refusal did not negate the approval of the reversion. It should also be noted, that on the Final Probation Report, there is an Employee Certification statement which reads, "I understand that my signature does not imply agreement with this evaluation. I also
understand that I may submit a statement of explanation to be included along with this evaluation, in the official record, as well as pursue any avenues of appeal available to me." Your file does not contain any record of your filing a grievance with AFSCME, or any written statement with respect to your disagreement with the decision of reversion.
- On December 9, 2008, you sent an email to the Hearings and Policy Division of the Human Resources Department with respect to the reversion. Ms. Brenda Braceful, Hearings and Policy Manager provided a three page response to your inquiny. Her response indicated that you said you filed a grievance with your union regarding this matter and she advised that you continue this path, as you were not eligible to file a grievance as set forth in Human Resources Department Rule 17 - Employee Grievances. In 2008, the AFSCME labor agreement provided that the grievance procedure contained within the labor agreement "shall be the exclusive grievance procedure for all members of the bargaining unit."
- On November 4, 2010, you contacted me, Gail A. Oxendine, who was then, the Human Resources (HR) Director for the City of Detroit. I referred you to the HR Manager for the HR Department, Ms. Benita Cheatom.
- On November 4, 2010 you contacted Ms. Benita Cheatom, HR Manager, regarding this same matter. Several emails were exchanged between you and Ms. Cheatom regarding this matter. Ms. Cheatom indicated there was nothing that could be done about this issue since you had been reverted to the Human Resources Department from Police two years prior. She indicated that the time limit for filing a grievance had expired two years prior. She also brought to your attention the Employee Certification statement on the final trial report as referenced earlier. You indicated you had filed grievances with three unions and that your prior Police supervisors lied about your performance.
- November, 2014, you again have made inquiries to Crystal Perkins, Business Analyst, Police HR, and to me, Gail A. Oxendine, Director of Police Personnel. However, you have not provided any additional information than what was provided in 2008 and 2010.


## Findings

- You were duly informed of your initial probationary period of 90 days. Your probationary period was recommended and approved for extension for an additional 90 days, in accordance with HR Rule 7 - Probation Periods and the AFSCME Labor Agreement.
- Prior to the end of the probation extension, you were recommended and approved for reversion to your prior classification and department. You were duly informed of the reversion.
- Although you indicated you filed grievances with three unions, you have NOT provided the final disposition of the grievance(s), nor is there any record in your personnel files with respect to a grievance being filed.
- There is no written record submitted by you, in June or July 2008, of your disagreement with the decision to extend your probation, or to revert to your previous classification. The first written notification of your disagreement was in December 2008, which was beyond the time period in which the AFSCME labor agreement provided for filing grievances.
- You have requested this matter be examined on at least three different occasions during the past $61 / 2$ years. You have been informed on each occasion, the rationale for reversion, and that there is nothing further the City of Detroit can do regarding this matter.

Given the above, your reversion from Senior Personnel and Payroll Clerk to Personnel and Payroll Clerk effective July 14, 2008, was proper, in accordance with Human Resources Rules, and is upheld. Please note that no further consideration will be given in this matter. This matter is considered permanently closed. Any further communication regarding this matter will not be addressed.

Hailaffrebun

GAIL A. OXENDINE

Director of Police Personnel

## Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed

| From: | Gail Oxendine [oxendineg@detroitmi.gov](mailto:oxendineg@detroitmi.gov) |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Bridget Murriel[BriMur@detroitmi.gov](mailto:BriMur@detroitmi.gov) |
| CC: | Crystal Perkins[PerkinsC@detroitmi.gov](mailto:PerkinsC@detroitmi.gov); Brian Tennille[Tennille@detroitmi.gov](mailto:Tennille@detroitmi.gov); DELIA |
| Date: | ENRIGHT[ENRIGHTDO27@detroitmi.gov](mailto:ENRIGHTDO27@detroitmi.gov) |
| Subject: | Monday - November 24, 2014 1:58 PM |
|  | Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed |

Ms. Muriel, as I just stated, I will again review your case and provide my findings.

However, you did not answer my question. Did you file a grievance with AFSCME in 2008 regarding this matter? If not, why? You were advised by the Hearings and Policy Division in December 2008 to do so.

Please advise.

Sent from my iPhone
On Nov 24, 2014, at 1:37 PM, Bridget Murriel < > wrote:

To Whom This May Concern,

Please review attachments submitted by the Hearing \& Policy investigation! I passed my probation period 06/10/08 as stated on my City of Detroit Notification of Probation form. The City of Detroit Notification of Probation form states Length of Probation 3 months, Final Probation Due 06/10/08, and the document is signed by my former Supervisor Odessa Lewis and I (Bridget Murriel) on 03/20/08. I was reverted to Personnel \& Payroll Clerk on 07/14/08. My last day worked as a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk was $07 / 11 / 08$. I worked 4 months, and 4 days under the title Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at Police Payroll until 07/14/08 when I was reverted back for no sound reason.

Thank you!
Human Resource Payroll

Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:

Mike Duggan, Mayor
>>> ""Xexrox" " < > 11/14/2014 07:28 PM >>>
<Fwd: Scan from a Xerox WorkCentre.eml>


What was the outcome of the grievance? Was it granted or not?

Sent from my iPhone
On Nov 24, 2014, at 2:06 PM, Bridget Murriel < > wrote:

Ms. Oxendine,
Yes, I filed a grievance in 2008 in regards to this matter it is stated on the Hearing \& Policy investigation documents that I filed a grievance. Please review all attachments!

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:
Mike Duggan, Mayor
$\ggg$ Gail Oxendine < $\quad>11 / 24 / 141: 58$ PM >>>
Ms. Muriel, as I just stated, I will again review your case and provide my findings.
However, you did not answer my question. Did you file a grievance with AFSCME in 2008 regarding this matter? If not, why? You were advised by the Hearings and Policy Division in December 2008 to do so.

Please advise.

Sent from my iPhone
On Nov 24, 2014, at 1:37 PM, Bridget Murriel <
$>$ wrote:

To Whom This May Concern,
13-53846-tjt Doc 9781-3 Filed 05/01/15 Entered 05/01/15 14:44:10 Page 20 of 23 http://gw.detroitmi.gov/gw/webacc?User.context=f165a171d965c19ff0622574cc... $\quad 11 / 29 / 2014$

Please review attachments submitted by the Hearing \& Policy investigation! I passed my probation period 06/10/08 as stated on my City of Detroit Notification of Probation form. The City of Detroit Notification of Probation form states Length of Probation 3 months, Final Probation Due 06/10/08, and the document is signed by my former Supervisor Odessa Lewis and I (Bridget Murriel) on 03/20/08. 1 was reverted to Personnel \& Payroll Clerk on 07/14/08. My last day worked as a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk was 07/11/08. I worked 4 months, and 4 days under the title Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at Police Payroll until 07/14/08 when I was reverted back for no sound reason.

Thank you!
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:
Mike Duggan, Mayor
>>> ""Xexrox" " <
> 11/14/2014 07:28 PM >>>
<Fwd: Scan from a Xerox WorkCentre.eml>

## Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed

| From: | Gail Oxendine [oxendineg@detroitmi.gov](mailto:oxendineg@detroitmi.gov) |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Bridget Murriel[BriMur@detroitmi.gov](mailto:BriMur@detroitmi.gov) |
| Date: | Monday - November 24, 2014 2:08 PM |
| Subject: | Re: Hearing and Policy Investigation Documents Enclosed |

Sent from my iPhone
On Nov 24, 2014, at 2:06 PM, Bridget Murriel <
> wrote:

Ms. Oxendine,
Yes, I filed a grievance in 2008 in regards to this matter it is stated on the Hearing \& Policy investigation documents that I filed a grievance. Please review all attachments!

Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Muriel
Payroll \& Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite\# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:
Mike Dagan, Mayor
>>> Gail Oxendine < > 11/24/14 1:58 PM >>>
Ms. Muriel, as I just stated, I will again review your case and provide my findings.
However, you did not answer my question. Did you file a grievance with AFSCME in 2008 regarding this matter? If not, why? You were advised by the Hearings and Policy Division in December 2008 to do so.

Please advise.

Sent from my iPhone
On Nov 24, 2014, at 1:37 PM, Bridget Muriel <
> wrote:

To Whom This May Concern,
Please review attachments submitted by the Hearing \& Policy investigation! I passed my probation period 06/10/08 as stated on my City of Detroit Notification of Probation form. The City of Detroit
13-53846-tjt Doc 9781-3 Filed 05/01/15 Entered 05/01/15 14:44:10 Page 22 of 23
http://gw.detroitmi.gov/gw/webacc?User.context=f165a171d965c19ff0622574cc... $\quad 11 / 29 / 2014$

Notification of Probation form states Length of Probation 3 months, Final Probation Due 06/10/08, and the document is signed by my former Supervisor Odessa Lewis and I (Bridget Murriel) on 03/20/08. I was reverted to Personnel \& Payroll Clerk on 07/14/08. My last day worked as a Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk was 07/11/08. I worked 4 months, and 4 days under the title Senior Personnel \& Payroll Clerk at Police Payroll until 07/14/08 when I was reverted back for no sound reason.

```
Thank you!
Human Resource Payroll
Bridget L. Murriel
Payroll & Personnel Clerk
City of Detroit - Payroll Department
Detroit Public Safety Headquarters
1301 Third
Suite# 6S-639
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Office: 313-870-2763
Fax: 313-664-3113
Fax: 313-870-0069
Email:
Mike Duggan, Mayor
>>> ""Xexrox" " < > 11/14/2014 07:28 PM >>>
```

<Fwd: Scan from a Xerox WorkCentre.eml>


[^0]:    >>> Bridget Murtel 11/4/2010 12:33 PM >>> Gail,

    I was reverted back to a Personnel \& Payroll Clerk for no reason.
    Human Resource Payroll
    Bridget L. Murriel
    Payrod \& Personnel Clerk
    Cly of Detroit - Payroll Department
    Suite\# 628
    Coleman A. Young Municipal Ctr.
    2 Woodward Avenue
    Detroit, Michigan 48226
    Office: 313-224-3940
    Fax: 313-628-0771
    Emall: BriMur@detroitmi.gov
    Dave Bing, Mayor

