## UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

|  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| In Re: | ) |  |
|  | ) | Chapter 11 |
| TELEXFREE, LLC, | ) |  |
| TELEXFREE, INC., | ) | Case No. 14-40987-MSH |
| TELEXFREE FINANCIAL, INC., | ) | Case No. 14-40988-MSH |
|  | Debtors. | ) |
|  |  |  |
|  |  | Jointly Administered |
|  |  |  |

## THIRTY-THIRD MOTION TO DISALLOW NET WINNER CLAIMS

To the Honorable Melvin S. Hoffman, United States Bankruptcy Judge:
Stephen B. Darr, the duly appointed Chapter 11 trustee (the "Trustee") of the bankruptcy estates (the "Estates") of TelexFree, LLC, TelexFree, Inc., and TelexFree Financial, Inc.
(collectively, the "Debtors" or "TelexFree"), respectfully submits this Thirty-Third Motion to Disallow Net Winner Claims with respect to those persons who purchased TelexFree membership plans ("Participants") and who filed proofs of claim indicating a negative balance (that is, the claim reflects that the Participant is a Net Winner under the Net Equity formula)("Net Winner Claims").

## Background

1. On April 13, 2014 (the "Petition Date"), the Debtors filed voluntary petitions for relief under Chapter 11 of the United States Bankruptcy Code ("Bankruptcy Code") with the United States Bankruptcy Court for the District of Nevada.
2. The Debtors initially operated as debtors-in-possession pursuant to Sections 1107 and 1108 of the Bankruptcy Code.
3. On the Petition Date, the Debtors filed a motion for joint administration of the cases, with TelexFree, LLC designated as the lead case. By order dated April 24, 2014, the motion for joint administration was approved.
4. On May 6, 2014, the Nevada Bankruptcy Court allowed the motion filed by the Securities and Exchange Commission to change the venue of the cases to the United States Bankruptcy Court for the District of Massachusetts (the "Court"). The cases were transferred to the Court on May 9, 2014.
5. On May 30, 2014, the Court allowed the motion by the Office of the United States Trustee's to appoint a Chapter 11 trustee, and the Trustee was appointed on June 6, 2014.
6. TelexFree operated one of the largest Ponzi and pyramid schemes in United States history in terms of the number of persons involved. TelexFree used the sale of voice over internet protocol ("VoIP") plans as a disguise for its real business, which was the recruitment of new Participants through a multi-level marketing format and the use of membership fees paid by new Participants to pay the credits redeemed by existing Participants.
7. TelexFree's scheme was extensive, complicated, and multi-tiered. Most of the Participants became involved in TelexFree through a "Triangular Transaction", whereby a Participant was recruited to join by purchasing a membership plan and paying the membership fees to a recruiting Participant, who retained the membership fee and used his/her accumulated TelexFree credits to pay the membership fee due from the recruited Participant.

## Claims Determination Process

8. On October 7, 2015, the Trustee filed his Motion by Chapter 11 Trustee for Entry of Order Finding that Debtors Engaged in Ponzi and Pyramid Scheme and Related Relief (the "Ponzi Motion"). In the Ponzi Motion, the Trustee sought two principal findings: first, that

TelexFree was a Ponzi and pyramid scheme and, second, that Participant claims should be determined based upon a "Net Equity" formula commonly employed in Ponzi scheme cases.
9. By order dated November 25, 2015, as amended on December 21, 2015, the Court found the Debtors had engaged in a Ponzi and pyramid scheme and that this finding was the law of the case.
10. By supplemental order dated January 26, 2016, the Court approved the Net Equity formula for determining Participant Claims. The Net Equity formula provides for the following:
(i) in determining the amount of a Participant Claim, any claim or portion of claim based upon accumulated credits in a Participant's account (a "User Account") as of the Petition Date shall be disallowed;
(ii) Participant Claims shall be computed based upon the amount paid by the Participant to the Debtors, including amounts paid pursuant to Triangular Transactions, less amounts received by the Participant from the Debtors including amounts received pursuant to Triangular Transactions;
(iii) In determining the amount of a claim of a Participant who has more than one User Account, the activity in all of the Participant's User Accounts shall be aggregated and netted against one another.
11. In the initial stages of these cases, Participants submitted proofs of claim in multiple places, including the Court, the claims agent retained by the Debtors, Kurtzman Carson Consultants, LLC ("KCC"), the Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI"), and the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, Office of the Secretary of State. The information provided by Participants in the forms did not provide sufficient information for the Trustee to reconcile Participant claims with TelexFree's books and records.
12. In order to establish a process for filing and evaluating claims that was consistent, accessible, and efficient, on October 7, 2015, the Trustee filed the Motion by Chapter 11 Trustee for Entry of Order Fixing Bar Date for Filing Proofs of Claim, Approving Form and

Manner of Providing Notice, Directing that Claims be Filed Electronically, and Approving Content of Electronic Proofs of Claim (the "Claims Motion"). Pursuant to the order approving the Claims Motion (the "Claims Order"), the deadline to file proofs of claim, as extended on two separate occasions, was March 15, 2017.
13. The Claims Order established a process whereby Participants would use an interactive, electronic claims portal hosted on the internet ("Portal") to file a claim (a "Participant ePOC") in accordance with the Net Equity formula. The Portal provided Participants with the opportunity to provide and/or confirm personal or business name(s), address(es), phone number(s), electronic mail address(es), taxpayer identification number(s), User Account name(s), password(s), and bank account information that were utilized by the Participants when establishing their User Account(s). Based upon the information provided by Participants, the Portal presented the Participant's User Accounts and account activity within the Participant's User Accounts. Participants had the opportunity to confirm, reject, amend, or supplement the information presented by the Portal.
14. The establishment of the Portal was essential to the claims resolution process. The Portal was the only practical method of verifying Participant activity with the TelexFree books and records. Inasmuch as TelexFree had approximately 1,000,000 Participants who collectively opened approximately 11,000,000 User Accounts that reflected more than 1,000,000,000 transactions, a manual reconciliation of Participant Claims against the TelexFree books and records without the Portal would have been impossible.
15. To date, approximately 135,000 Participant ePOC's have been filed. The Trustee has reconciled to the TelexFree books and records and conditionally allowed approximately 100,000 Participant ePOC’s.
16. On October 16, 2017, the Trustee filed a Motion by Chapter 11 Trustee to Establish Omnibus Procedures for the Resolution of Disputed Participant Claims (docket entry 921) which was approved by order dated December 26, 2017 (the "Claims Procedure Order", docket entry 955).
17. Eight thousand eighty-six $(8,086)$ Participants filed Net Winner Claims, that is, the claims reflected that the Participant received more from TelexFree than they paid to TelexFree, including consideration of amounts received and paid through Triangular Transactions.
18. Although not required to by the terms of the Claims Procedure Order, the Trustee sent a letter (the "Claims Letter") electronically to the Net Winner Claim holders at the addresses listed on their claims, providing them with thirty (30) days to submit additional documentation to establish their claims and informing them that, in the absence of additional information, the Trustee would move to have the claims disallowed.
19. The Trustee previously filed thirty-two (32) motions to disallow Net Winner Claims. The Participants who are the subject of this motion were not included in prior motions to disallow claims because such Participants submitted a response in some form to the Claims Letter. The Trustee has conducted a more extensive review of the claims for which a response was received and, after completing his review, the Trustee has determined that the claims should be disallowed. ${ }^{1}$

## Objection to Net Winner Claims

20. The Participants listed on Exhibit "A" hereto filed Net Winner Claims.

[^0]21. Based upon the information provided in the Participant ePOC's, the Participants listed on Exhibit "A" are not entitled to an allowed claim against the Estates, and the claims should be disallowed.

## Notice

22. The Trustee requests that he be authorized to serve the Notice of (I) Motion to Disallow Net Winner Claims, (II) Deadline to Submit Response, and (III) Scheduling of NonEvidentiary Hearing (the "Notice") approved by the Court on July 29, 2019 with respect to this motion. As set forth in the Notice, responses must be sent to

## ClaimResponse@telexfreeclaims.com.

23. In accordance with the Claims Procedure Order, the Trustee intends to have this motion translated into Spanish and Portuguese and served upon all Participants referenced in Exhibit "A" hereto.

Wherefore, the Trustee prays that the Court:

1. Enter an order disallowing each of the Net Winner Claims identified on Exhibit "A" hereto; and
2. Granting such other relief as is just and proper.

STEPHEN B. DARR, CHAPTER 11 TRUSTEE, By his attorneys,
/s/ Andrew G. Lizotte
Harold B. Murphy (BBO \#362610)
Andrew G. Lizotte (BBO \#559609)
Murphy \& King, Professional Corporation
One Beacon Street
Boston, MA 02108
Dated: December 30, 2019
768099

Case 14-40987
Doc 2903
Filed 12/30/19 Entered 12/30/19 15:47:08
Desc Main



Case 14-40987
Doc 2903
Filed 12/30/19 Entered 12/30/19 15:47:08
Desc Main


| Claim Number | Claimant Name | Country of Residence ${ }^{1}$ | Amount of Claim as Filed | Proposed Allowed Amount | Notes |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 64855-000 | Goodhead Frank Enyinnaya | Nigeria | $(6,911.10)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 100484-000 | Nwanna Joy John | Nigeria | $(3,771.70)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 127060-001 | Rogesin Oluwaniyi | Nigeria | $(1,569.00)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 03050-000 | Ernesto Daniel Fernandez Rey | Peru | (60,774.90) | Disallowed |  |
| 07942-000 | Josue Pablo Sierralta Beltran | Peru | $(43,369.55)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 19623-000 | Willy Elam Recharte | Peru | $(3,364.70)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 63708-000 | Rolo Fredy Venancio Vidal | Peru | $(108,407.60)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 84932-000 | Blanca Gavi Cavero Villegas | Peru | $(6,978.00)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 87490-000 | Edgar Tuesta Ramos | Peru | (2,674.65) | Disallowed |  |
| 89020-000 | Brenda Bravo Cavero | Peru | (4,714.40) | Disallowed |  |
| 89290-000 | Devora Paola Molero Cavero | Peru | (99.80) | Disallowed |  |
| 107465-000 | Albert Douglas Pacheco Carhuarupay | Peru | (539.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 115239-000 | Catty Reyes Huaman | Peru | (2,176.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 121262-000 | Nehemias Acevedo Llacctas Acevedo Llacctas | Peru | (27,802.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 121442-000 | Denis Cabrera Mendoza | Peru | (7,058.35) | Disallowed |  |
| 1214433-000 | Denis Cabrera Mendoza | Peru | (7,058.35) | Disallowed |  |
| 124810-000 | Carlos Alberto Arrieta Vega | Peru | $(5,360.10)$ | Disallowed |  |
| $02911-000$ | Maria Da Luz Ribeiro De Sousa Pereira | Portugal | (24,279.50) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 31234-000 | Paulo Jose Gomes Palma | Portugal | (7,127.75) | Disallowed |  |
| 96907-000 | Maria Leocadia Garcia Branco | Portugal | $(7,174.90)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 109653-000 | Ana Raquel Costa | Portugal | (18,695.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 124210-000 | Fernando Paiva | Portugal | (9,415.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 00342-000 | Jean Chrysostome Bikomeye | Rwanda | (600.75) | Disallowed |  |
| 15486-000 | Rukoro Bizigira Alain | Rwanda | (49.90) | Disallowed |  |
| 19439-000 | Rukoro Bizigira Alain | Rwanda | (49.90) | Disallowed |  |
| 97049-000 | Jean Dela Croix Gatete | Rwanda | (27,200.10) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121322-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | (27,200.10) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121325-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | ( $2,412.70$ ) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121328-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | $(5,212.80)$ | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121332-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | $(5,212.80)$ | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121605-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | (27,200.10) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121606-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | (5,974.70) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 121615-000 | Jeandelacroix Gatete | Rwanda | (3,136.80) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 04198-000 | Ma Piopar Rodríguez Vidal | Spain | (6,551.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 04646-000 | M ${ }^{\text {a }}$ P Pilar Rodríguez Vidal | Spain | (7,239.90) | Disallowed |  |
| 04649-000 | Ma Pilar Rodríguez Vidal | Spain | (6,551.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 07991-000 | Julian Mittelmann | Spain | (1,425.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 17983-000 | Joan Pere Fornis Mateu | Spain | (839.22) | Disallowed |  |
| $56761-000$ | Santiago Bravo Pozo | Spain | (3,294.93) | Disallowed |  |
| 60506-000 | Angel Maria Osuna Luque | Spain | (299.40) | Disallowed |  |
| 62069-000 | Juan Aunon Negrillo Aunon Negrillo | Spain | $(6,457.60)$ | Disallowed |  |
| $73750-000$ | Francisco Pedro Almodovar Sanchez | Spain | (21,601.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 102144-000 | Francisco Javier Fernandez Martos Machado | Spain | (127.70) | Disallowed |  |
| 102765-000 | Nancy Edith Fassina Pascual | Spain | (44,502.50) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 117846-000 | Jose Miguel Munoz Perez | Spain | (1,976.60) | Disallowed |  |
| $123153-000$ | Eva Maria Garnes Ruiz | Spain | (25,898.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 129131-001 | Carlos Amador Cabanillas Becerra Amador Cabanillas Becerra | Spain | $(65,465.40)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 129259-000 | Carlos Amador Cabanillas Becerra Carlos Cabanillas | Spain | $(65,465.40)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 129648-000 |  | Spain | (1,050.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 27377-000 | Chan Yuan Chang | Taiwan | (38,548.80) | Disallowed |  |
| 71782-000 | Ssu Yi Lin | Taiwan | ( $5,7,799.80)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 71844-000 | Tai Tzu Lee | Taiwan | (1,574.70) | Disallowed |  |
| 81744-000 | Chiung Tzu Su | Taiwan | (14,598.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 84856-000 | Wei Ling Chen | Taiwan | (1,724.40) | Disallowed |  |
| 84950-000 | Chin Hua Lee | Taiwan | (3,032.80) | Disallowed |  |
| 89140-000 | Pin Hsun Lee | Taiwan | (1,642.30) | Disallowed |  |
| 99072-000 | Shu Hsiang Lee | Taiwan | (898.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 100523-000 | Chan Yuan Wang | Taiwan | (61,377.40) | Disallowed |  |
| $116453-000$ | Fan Su | Taiwan | (14,598.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 69564-000 | Simon Odoch | Uganda | (14,246.20) | Disallowed |  |
| $89707-000$ | Mukenye Samson | Uganda | (1,088.10) | Disallowed |  |
| 90482-000 | Nabeeta Andrew | Uganda | (3,429.10) | Disallowed |  |
| 99163-000 | Nabeeta Andrew | Uganda | (3,429.10) | Disallowed |  |
| 30488-000 | Kevin Hall | United Kingdom | (1,927.10) | Disallowed |  |

Case 14-40987
Doc 2903
Filed 12/30/19 Entered 12/30/19 15:47:08
Desc Main


| Claim Number | Claimant Name | Country of Residence ${ }^{1}$ | Amount of Claim as Filed | Proposed Allowed Amount | Notes |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 00557-000 | Marcel H Agnolin | United States | (37,157.70) | Disallowed |  |
| 00858-000 | Jose Anibal Bello | United States | $(17,201.30)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 01850-000 | Taiwo Christopher Adejobi | United States | $(11,207.50)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 02099-000 | Anne Njeri Mbugua | United States | $(2,450.10)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 03217-000 | Lyubov Yakir | United States | $(51,654.80)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 03730-000 | Heng Sovannra | United States | $(1,000.70)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 04405-000 | Keith Earl Forester | United States | $(26,279.02)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 04487-000 | Gildo Pereira Marques | United States | (9,390.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 08166-000 | Gloria E Mazzio | United States | (14,460.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 09319-000 | Petr Yagyaev | United States | (21,583.48) | Disallowed |  |
| $09367-000$ | Caroline Kaigai | United States | (570.10) | Disallowed |  |
| 09558-000 | Rosette Baseka | United States | (61,502.92) | Disallowed |  |
| $09853-000$ | Carlos Andres Montiel | United States | (1,425.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 10089-000 | Lee Por Xiong | United States | (7,297.40) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 13196-000 | Elena Manzueta | United States | (339.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 18206-000 | Svetlana Margolina | United States | (8,701.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 18763-000 | Svetlana Margolina | United States | (28,701.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 23711-000 | Luis Arce | United States | (15,509.68) | Disallowed |  |
| 27763-000 | Oto Ranzoni Gomes | United States | (7,145.27) | Disallowed |  |
| 27792-000 | Sam Farra | United States | (62,916.11) | Disallowed |  |
| 35812-000 | Modesto Maldonado | United States | (8,852.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 36927-000 | Kerry Lynn Chavis | United States | (24,250.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 36942-000 | Fernando Solis | United States | $(2,516.20)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 38139-000 | Toni P Scolaro | United States | (208,297.26) | Disallowed |  |
| 39273-000 | Omar LFernandez | United States | (70.00) | Disallowed |  |
| 45301-000 | Yara Aixa Acosta | United States | (29,438.93) | Disallowed |  |
| 45448-000 | Nora Eliana Hernandez Avila | United States | (10,671.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 46597-000 | Jairo Ardila | United States | (12,213.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 49504-000 | Marceliana Hodas | United States | $(1,500,533.33)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 50915-000 | Stephen Anthony Lambkin | United States | (12,846.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 52952-000 | Sylvia Munoz | United States | (3,656.22) | Disallowed |  |
| 53746-000 | Denizhan Ozturk | United States | (349.30) | Disallowed |  |
| 54853-000 | Oladipupo Adesina | United States | (10,544.35) | Disallowed |  |
| 57695-000 | Miguelina Vargas | United States | ( $2,602.40$ ) | Disallowed |  |
| 59474-000 | Nonna Gomberg | United States | (799.80) | Disallowed |  |
| 59826-000 | Ronald Heinrich Looney | United States | (25,831.82) | Disallowed |  |
| 60234-000 | Glenda Ivette Agostini-Miranda | United States | (1,275.30) | Disallowed |  |
| 60250-000 | Juan Gabriel Ramirez | United States | ( $2,525.10$ ) | Disallowed |  |
| 63028-000 | Juan Francisco Padron Trillo Francisco Padron | United States | ( $2,3988.80$ ) | Disallowed |  |
| 63805-000 | Raul Junior Escobar | United States | (3,139.10) | Disallowed |  |
| 64437-000 | Kwikook Kim | United States | (89,749.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 66187-000 | Sydney Hagen | United States | (3,503.92) | Disallowed |  |
| 67120-000 | Adam Oliveira | United States | $(189,380.90)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 67474-000 | Carlos Correa | United States | $(32,458.12)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 68813-000 | Jeffrey Manalili | United States | (3,066.00) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 71016-000 | Ronald Ylanan Tan | United States | (38,114.85) | Disallowed |  |
| 74628-000 | Sybil Renea Oneal | United States | (49.90) | Disallowed |  |
| 81032-000 | Marcio Oliveira | United States | (5,858.60) | Disallowed |  |
| 87362-000 | Graciela Flores | United States | (10.20) | Disallowed | 2 |
| 87982-000 | Rubiela Lopez | United States | $(1,896.20)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 88315-000 | Antonina Jaime | United States | (24,533.48) | Disallowed |  |
| $95827-000$ | Elena Manzueta | United States | (728.50) | Disallowed |  |
| 97120-000 | Jose Efrain Osorio | United States | (1,650.80) | Disallowed |  |
| 102982-001 | Manoel Batista Silva | United States | (898.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 105131-001 | Emmanuel N Ndenga | United States | (41,681.30) | Disallowed |  |
| 107455-000 | Walter Patricio Alvarado | United States | $(4,595.05)$ | Disallowed |  |
| 107707-000 | Song Her Yang | United States | ( $1,724.40$ ) | Disallowed |  |
| 115754-000 | Edelzamir J Da Silva | United States | (2,999.70) | Disallowed |  |
| 120571-000 | Roshel Aminov | United States | (76,587.30) | Disallowed |  |
| 126482-000 | Juan B Chile | United States | (5,684.84) | Disallowed |  |
| 126523-000 | Andris Jean | United States | (432.40) | Disallowed |  |
| 126932-000 | Rebecca Chebet Kibett | United States | (2,772.30) | Disallowed |  |
| 127473-000 | Peterson Pereira | United States | ( $2,683.70$ ) | Disallowed |  |
| 127592-000 | Robert James Houchin | United States | (6,215.01) | Disallowed |  |
| 127783-000 | Lee Por Xiong | United States | (6,247.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 129310-0-000 | Claudio Batista Dos Anjos | United States | (268,365.50) | Disallowed |  |


| Claim Number | Claimant Name | Country of Residence ${ }^{1}$ | Amount of Claim as Filed | Proposed Allowed Amount | Notes |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 129616-000 | Basilio Florian | United States | (1,997.20) | Disallowed |  |
| 130446-000 | Odete Czremeta | United States | (29,376.40) | Disallowed |  |

## Notes

1: Country of Residence as entered by Claimant on the claim form filed electronically.
2: Claimant did not identify his or her name in the "Creditor Name" field of the claim form, and therefore claimant name was derived from the "Signature" field. The "Notice" and "Registration" fields were also considered as necessary.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ The Trustee has separately commenced adversary proceedings seeking affirmative recovery from Net Winners in the TelexFree scheme (Adv Proc Nos. 16-4006 and 16-4007). This motion does not seek determination of any rights of the Trustee to affirmative recovery but rather seeks only to disallow the Net Winner Claims for purposes of participating in any distributions by the Estates.

