John Kingston (pro hac vice) Michael Nepple (pro hac vice) Brian Hockett (pro hac vice) THOMPSON COBURN LLP

One US Bank Plaza

St. Louis, MO 63101

Telephone: (314) 552-6000 Facsimile: (314) 552-7000

Counsel for Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC

IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re:) Chapter 11		
WINDSTREAM HOLDINGS, INC., et al.,	Case No. 19-22312 (RDD)		
Debtors.)) (Jointly Administered))		
WINDSTREAM HOLDINGS, INC., et al.,))		
Plaintiffs,) Adv. Pro. No. 19-08246		
vs.))		
CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC. and CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING, LLC,)))		
Defendants.)))		

NOTICE OF HEARING ON DEFENDANTS CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC. AND CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING, LLC'S EX-PARTE MOTION TO SEAL PORTIONS OF DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF DR. HENRY OSTBERG

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on January 9, 2020, Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC filed their Ex-Parte Motion to Seal Portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg.

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that a hearing shall be held on January 16, 2020 at 10:00 a.m. (Eastern time) (the "Hearing"), or as soon thereafter as counsel may be heard, before the Honorable Robert D. Drain, United States Bankruptcy Judge, at the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Southern District of New York, 300 Quarropas Street, White Plains, NY 10601, to consider Defendants Ex-Parte Motion to Seal Portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg (the "Motion").

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that objections, if any, to the relief sought in the Motion must be filed through the Bankruptcy Court's electronic filing system as to be received on or before January 15, 2020 at 12:00 p.m. (Eastern Time) by counsel to Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC, Brian Hockett and John Kingston, Thompson Coburn LLP, One US Bank Plaza, Suite 2700, St. Louis, MO 63101.

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE, that if no objections are timely filed and served with respect to the Motion, the Court may deem any opposition waived,

treat the Motion as conceded, and enter an order granting the relief requested in the Motion without further notice or hearing.

PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE, that the Hearing may be continued or adjourned from time to time without further notice.

Dated: January 9, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

THOMPSON COBURN LLP

By /s/ John Kingston

John Kingston (pro hac vice)
Michael Nepple (pro hac vice)
Brian Hockett (pro hac vice)
THOMPSON COBURN LLP
One U.S. Bank Plaza, Suite 2700
St. Louis, MO 63101
314-552-6000
314-552-7000 (fax)
jkingston@thompsoncoburn.com
mnepple@thompsoncoburn.com
bhockett@thompsoncoburn.com

Attorney for Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 9th day of January, 2020, I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Notice of Hearing on Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC's Ex-Parte Motion to Seal Portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg via operation of the Court's Electronic Filing System upon all counsel of record in the adversary proceeding.

Undersigned counsel Notice of Hearing on Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC's Ex-Parte Motion to Seal Portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg will be sent via electronic mail on this 9th day of January, 2020 to the following:

Terence P. Ross
Kristin Lockhart
Michael R. Justus
2900 K Street NW
North Tower – Suite 200
Washington, DC 20007-5118
terence.ross@kattenlaw.com
kristin.lockhart@kattenlaw.com
michael.justus@kattenlaw.com

Shaya Rochester Katten Muchin Rosenman LLP 575 Madison Avenue New York, NY 10022-2585 shaya.rochester@kattenlaw.com

United States Trustee
Paul K. Schwartzburg
U.S. Department of Justice
Office of the United States Trustee
201 Varick Street, Rm. 1006
New York, NY 10014
Paul.schwartzberg@usdoj.gov

Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors Steve Rappoport Lorenzo Marinuzzi Morrison & Foerster LLP 250 West 55th Street New York, NY 10019-9601 srappoport@mofo.com lmarinuzzi@mofo.com

/s/ John Kingston

John Kingston (pro hac vice) Michael Nepple (pro hac vice) Brian Hockett (pro hac vice) THOMPSON COBURN LLP

One US Bank Plaza St. Louis, MO 63101

Telephone: (314) 552-6000 Facsimile: (314) 552-7000

Counsel for Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC

IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re:) Chapter 11		
WINDSTREAM HOLDINGS, INC., et al.,	Case No. 19-22312 (RDD)		
Debtors.) (Jointly Administered)		
WINDSTREAM HOLDINGS, INC., et al.,))		
Plaintiffs,) Adv. Pro. No. 19-08246		
vs.))		
CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC. and CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING, LLC,)))		
Defendants.)))		

DEFENDANTS CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC.
AND CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING, LLC'S
EX-PARTE MOTION TO SEAL PORTIONS OF DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE
IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE
TESTIMONY OF DR. HENRY OSTBERG

Pursuant to 11 U.S.C. § 107(b), 11 U.S.C. §§ 101 et seq., Rule 9018 of the Federal Rules of Bankruptcy Procedure, and Rule 9018-1 of the Local Rules of the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Southern District of New York, Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC (Charter) move to file under seal redacted portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg. In support, Charter states:

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 1. The Court currently has jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1334 and the Amended Standing Order of Reference from the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, dated February 1, 2012.
 - 2. Venue is proper in this district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1409.
- 3. The bases for the relief requested herein are sections 105(a) and 107(b) of the Bankruptcy Code, Bankruptcy Rule 9018, and Local Rule 9077-1(b).

GROUNDS FOR RELIEF

- 4. Charter moves to file Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg in redacted form. The portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg that are proposed to be redacted were previously filed under seal by Charter.
- 5. The information sought to be filed under seal have been designated as either CONFIDENTIAL or CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY pursuant to the parties' Confidentiality Agreement and Stipulated Protective Order (ECF 74) or involve confidential subject matter derived from such documents.

- 6. Section 107(b) of the Bankruptcy Code authorizes courts to issue orders that will protect entities from the potential harm that may result from the disclosure of certain confidential information. This section provides, in part:
 - (b) On request of a party in interest, the bankruptcy court shall, and on the bankruptcy court's own motion, the bankruptcy court may—
 - (1) protect an entity with respect to a trade secret or confidential research, development, or commercial information...

11 U.S.C. § 107(b)(1).

7. Bankruptcy Rule 9018 further provides, in part:

On motion or on its own initiative, with or without notice, the court may make any order which justice requires (1) to protect the estate or any entity in respect of a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information

Fed. R. Bankr. P. 9018.

- 8. Unless this motion to seal is withdrawn, the documents sought to be sealed by this motion should be sealed for the duration of this matter pursuant to the parties' protective order. Charter will retrieve the documents from the Court at the conclusion of this matter and dispose of the materials in compliance with all applicable protective orders.
- 9. Those with access to the sealed and unredacted documents are Charter, Windstream, the Court, the U.S. Trustee, counsel for the Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors and any other party as may be ordered by the Court or agreed to by Charter and a counterparty to any such document, in each case, under appropriate confidentiality agreements satisfactory to Charter.
- 10. Charter has made no prior request for the relief sought herein to this or any other court.

WHEREFORE, Charter respectfully requests that the Court enter an order, substantially in the form attached hereto and grant such other and further relief as is just and appropriate under the circumstances.

Dated: January 9, 2020 Respectfully submitted,

THOMPSON COBURN LLP

By: /s/ John Kingston

John Kingston (pro hac vice)
Michael Nepple (pro hac vice)
Brian Hockett (pro hac vice)
THOMPSON COBURN LLP
One U.S. Bank Plaza, Suite 2700
St. Louis, MO 63101
314-552-6000
314-552-7000 (fax)
jkingston@thompsoncoburn.com
mnepple@thompsoncoburn.com
bhockett@thompsoncoburn.com

Attorneys for Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 9th day of January, 2020, I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing **DEFENDANTS CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS**, **INC. AND CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING**, **LLC'S EX-PARTE MOTION TO SEAL PORTIONS OF DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF DR. HENRY OSTBERG** via operation of the Court's Electronic Filing System upon all counsel of record in the adversary proceeding.

Undersigned counsel will send a true and correct copy of **DEFENDANTS CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS**, **INC. AND CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING**, **LLC'S EX-PARTE MOTION TO SEAL PORTIONS OF DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF DR. HENRY OSTBERG** via email on this 9th day of January, 2020 to the following:

Terence P. Ross
Kristin Lockhart
Michael R. Justus
2900 K Street NW
North Tower – Suite 200
Washington, DC 20007-5118
terence.ross@kattenlaw.com
kristin.lockhart@kattenlaw.com
michael.justus@kattenlaw.com

Shaya Rochester Katten Muchin Rosenman LLP 575 Madison Avenue New York, NY 10022-2585 shaya.rochester@kattenlaw.com

United States Trustee
Paul K. Schwartzburg
U.S. Department of Justice
Office of the United States Trustee
201 Varick Street, Rm. 1006
New York, NY 10014
Paul.schwartzberg@usdoj.gov

Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors Steve Rappoport Lorenzo Marinuzzi Morrison & Foerster LLP 250 West 55th Street New York, NY 10019-9601 srappoport@mofo.com lmarinuzzi@mofo.com

/s/ John Kingston

IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re:) Chapter 11		
WINDSTREAM HOLDINGS, INC., et al.,	Case No. 19-22312 (RDD)		
Debtors.) (Jointly Administered)		
WINDSTREAM HOLDINGS, INC., et al., Plaintiffs,)))) Adv. Pro. No. 19-08246		
Vs.))		
CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC. and CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING, LLC,)))		
Defendants.)))		

[PROPOSED] ORDER ON DEFENDANTS CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS, INC. AND CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS OPERATING, LLC'S EX-PARTE MOTION TO SEAL PORTIONS OF DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF DR. HENRY OSTBERG

Upon the [unopposed] motion (the "Motion") of Defendants Charter Communications, Inc. and Charter Communications Operating, LLC (collectively "Charter") for entry of an order (this "Order") under 11 U.S.C. § 107 authorizing Charter to file under seal certain portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg ("Sealed Documents"); and the Court having found that Charter provided due and sufficient notice of the Motion and that no other notice or hearing is required; and, after due deliberation, this Court having determined that the legal and factual bases set forth in the Motion establishes sufficient cause for the relief granted herein, in that the proposed information that the

Motion seeks to restrict from the public docket of this case is properly protected under 11 U.S.C. § 107(b)(1) as confidential commercial information; now, therefore, it is hereby ORDERED that:

- 1. The Motion is granted as set forth herein.
- 2. Charter is authorized to filed under seal portions of Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Henry Ostberg by providing them to the Clerk's Office at 300 Quarropas Street, White Plains, New York along with a copy of this Order, and (b) to file a redacted version thereof on the public docket of this case; <u>provided</u>, that Charter redacts only that information that is considered confidential and commercially sensitive pursuant to Sections 105(a) and 107(b)(1) of the Bankruptcy Code, Bankruptcy Rule 9018, and Local Bankruptcy Rule 9018-1.
- 3. Except upon further order of the Court after notice to the Charter, the Sealed Documents shall remain under seal, and shall not be made available to anyone without the consent of Charter, with the exception that unredacted copies of the Sealed Documents shall be provided to (a) the Court, (b) the United States Trustee, (c) counsel to Plaintiffs, (d) counsel to the Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors appointed in these Chapter 11 cases, and (e) any other party as may be ordered by the Court or agreed to by Charter and a counterparty to any such Sealed Document, in each case, under appropriate confidentiality agreements satisfactory to Charter. Each party to whom disclosure is made shall keep the Sealed Documents confidential.
- 4. Charter is authorized to take all actions necessary to effectuate the ruling set forth in this Order.
- 5. This Order is without prejudice to the rights of any party in interest, or the United States Trustee, to seek to unseal the Sealed Documents or any part thereof.

19-08246-rdd Doc 225 Filed 01/09/20 Entered 01/09/20 16:05:57 Main Document Pg 12 of 12

6. Counsel for Charter shall contact the Clerk's Office regarding the return or other disposition of the Sealed Documents within 10 days after resolution of the relief requested in the Complaint. If Charter fails to do so, the Clerk of the Court is authorized to destroy the Sealed Documents.

7. This Court retains exclusive jurisdiction with respect to all matters arising from or related to the implementation, interpretation, and enforcement of this Order.

Dated:		_, 2020	
	New York, NY		
			THE HONORABLE ROBERT D. DRAIN
			LINITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT HIDGE